

# For Reference

---

**NOT TO BE TAKEN FROM THIS ROOM**

Ex LIBRIS  
UNIVERSITATIS  
ALBERTAEISIS











THE UNIVERSITY OF ALBERTA

A STUDY OF THE DEGREE OF IMPLEMENTATION OF RECOMMENDATIONS  
PERTAINING TO ORGANIZATION AND ADMINISTRATION  
MADE BY THE ROYAL COMMISSION ON  
EDUCATION IN ALBERTA, 1959

by

(C)

DONALD D. DALOISE

A THESIS

SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES IN PARTIAL  
FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE  
OF MASTER OF EDUCATION

DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATIONAL ADMINISTRATION

EDMONTON, ALBERTA

FALL, 1970



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2020 with funding from  
University of Alberta Libraries

<https://archive.org/details/Daloise1970>

UNIVERSITY OF ALBERTA  
FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES

The undersigned certify that they have read, and  
recommend to the Faculty of Graduate Studies for acceptance,  
a thesis entitled "A Study of the Degree of Implementation of  
Recommendations Pertaining to Organization and Administration  
made by the Royal Commission on Education in Alberta, 1959"  
submitted by Donald Domenic Daloise in partial fulfilment of  
the requirements for the degree of Master of Education.

Date September 25, 1970



## ABSTRACT

This study was designed to provide information on four general questions pertaining to selected recommendations made by the Royal Commission on Education in Alberta in 1957:

1. What forces or conditions were influential in the ordering of the Royal Commission on Education in 1957?
2. What were the origins of the final recommendations of the Commission Report?
3. What was the degree of acceptance of the recommendations?
4. To what extent have the recommendations been implemented and what factors might explain the varying degrees of implementation?

Information was also provided on numerous specific questions detailed within the conceptual framework of the study.

The conceptual framework is comprised of four levels corresponding, respectively, to the four general questions. These four levels are The Forces, The Origins and Sources, The Reactions and The Actions.

The Forces are described in terms of the climate of the times in Alberta in the decade preceding the ordering of the Commission. The sources of the recommendations were defined to be the formal submissions made by various groups, organizations, or individuals. The origins of recommendations were defined to be the social, economic, political, and educational forces and conditions that were prominent in Alberta in the



era preceding the ordering of the Cameron Commission. The Reaction of various groups is defined in terms of approval or non-approval and the Action is defined as one of four degrees of present implementation of the recommendations--implemented in part, implemented in full, still under consideration and rejected.

The analysis of the Forces and Origins and Sources indicated that no single force could be identified as having precipitated the ordering of the Cameron Commission but, rather, the Commission was a response to, as well as being a part of, the climate of the times. One force which did appear to exert a considerable influence was the rapidly expanding economic base and the concomitant increased urbanization. A significant educational consequence of these developments was the elimination of a rural-urban distinction for educational purposes. The analysis also indicated a significant influence exerted by educators on the conclusions of the Commission and a comparative disinterest in the Commission, and in education in general, on the part of the public.

The analysis of the Reactions and Actions indicated several possible explanations for the present degree of implementation of various recommendations. An unfavourable initial reaction towards a recommendation by the implementing group or groups was seen to be detrimental to implementation of a recommendation or, at least, to its early implementation. Implementation was also seen to have been prevented if the intent of a recommendation was contrary to the policy of the implementing group or if the recommendation was not specific as to its intent or group at which it was directed.

Implications and suggestions for further study are stated as a result of the conclusions of the study.



#### ACKNOWLEDGMENT

Grateful acknowledgment is expressed to all those who assisted so willingly in the gathering of data through correspondence, granting of personal interviews, and searching for long forgotten files.

The writer also wishes to express his sincere appreciation to his advisor, Dr. E. Miklos, for his patience, understanding, and guidance throughout the preparation of this thesis. Appreciation is also extended to Dr. Friesen and Dr. Hersom for their valuable assistance on the thesis committee.

Sincere thanks are expressed to the writer's fellow graduate students who so willingly offered advice during this study and especially to Mr. A. Wilcer and Mr. R. Maddocks, the writer's co-workers on the research project, whose contributions to this study were invaluable.

Grateful acknowledgment is extended to the Alberta Human Resources Research Council for its generous financial assistance.

Finally, the writer wishes to express his deepest gratitude to the members of his family for their encouragement and understanding.



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter	Page
1. INTRODUCTION .....	1
The Problem .....	3
Purpose of the Study .....	4
Conceptual Framework .....	5
The forces .....	5
The origins and sources .....	7
The reactions .....	7
The actions .....	7
Criteria For Assessing Degree of Implementation ....	8
Sub-Questions of the Study .....	11
Delimitations of the Study .....	13
Limitations of the Study .....	14
Significance of the Study .....	15
Collection of Data .....	15
Overview of Report .....	16
2. FORCES AND CONDITIONS .....	17
The Early Fifties .....	17
The Influence of the United States .....	18
Progressivism versus traditionalism .....	18
The impact of Russian technological supremacy ....	21
Other Commissions on Education .....	23
The Press .....	24



Chapter	Page
Public Attitudes .....	25
A Changing Economic Base .....	28
Population Patterns and Rural Education .....	32
DISCUSSION .....	34
SUMMARY .....	36
3. ORIGINS AND SOURCES OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS .....	37
SOURCES OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS .....	38
Limitations in Identifying the Sources .....	38
The Royal Commission Compilation .....	39
Adaptation For This Study .....	41
The Effect of Informal Interaction .....	47
ORIGINS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS .....	47
Administrative Personnel .....	48
Facilities and Equipment .....	50
Other Matters of Organization .....	52
DISCUSSION .....	53
SUMMARY .....	54
4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERSONNEL .....	56
THE REACTIONS .....	56
THE ACTIONS .....	64
Superintendents and Special Services .....	64
Principals .....	67
Guidance .....	69
DISCUSSION .....	74
SUMMARY .....	77



Chapter	Page
5. FACILITIES AND EQUIPMENT .....	78
THE REACTIONS .....	78
THE ACTIONS .....	83
Facilities and Equipment .....	84
School Buses .....	85
Residences .....	86
Libraries .....	87
Audio-Visual Aids .....	92
Television .....	94
Improvement of Textbooks .....	96
DISCUSSION .....	97
SUMMARY .....	100
6. OTHER MATTERS OF ORGANIZATION .....	102
THE REACTIONS .....	102
THE ACTIONS .....	105
Staff Load .....	105
Hutterites .....	106
Indians .....	110
DISCUSSION .....	116
SUMMARY .....	119
7. CONCLUSIONS, IMPLICATIONS AND DISCUSSION, AND SUGGESTION FOR FURTHER STUDY .....	121
SUMMARY OF THE PROBLEM .....	121
CONCLUSIONS .....	122
Forces, Origins, and Sources .....	123
Reactions and Actions .....	127



Chapter	Page
IMPLICATIONS AND DISCUSSION .....	130
SUGGESTIONS FOR FURTHER STUDY .....	132
SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY .....	134
APPENDIX A. PERSONAL INTERVIEWS CONDUCTED .....	139
B. PERSONS PROVIDING RELEVANT INFORMATION BY CORRESPONDENCE .....	140
C. MASTER CARD: BROWN COMPILATION .....	141
D. NUMERICAL LIST OF BRIEFS REFERRED TO IN THIS STUDY .	142
E. RECOMMENDATIONS REFERRED TO .....	143
F. REGULATIONS RE LOCALLY APPOINTED SUPERINTENDENTS ...	149



## LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
1. Net Values of Productivity in the Major Areas of Economic Activity .....	29
2. Sources of Recommendations Pertaining to Administrative Personnel .....	44
3. Sources of Recommendations Pertaining to Facilities and Equipment .....	45
4. Sources of Recommendations Pertaining to Other Matters of Organization .....	46
5. Official Reaction of the Alberta School Trustees' Association to Those Recommendations Pertaining to Administrative Personnel Considered to be the Responsibility of Boards .....	59
6. Reaction of the Special Committee of the Department of Education to those Recommendations Pertaining to Administrative Personnel .....	60
7. Official Reaction of the Department of Education to those Recommendations Pertaining to Administrative Personnel ..	61
8. Reaction of the Faculty of Education to those Recommendations Pertaining to Administrative Personnel ..	62
9. Responses of Counsellors, Teachers, and Principals to Selected Questions from "A Study of Career Decisions of Canadian Youth .....	70
10. The Degree of Implementation of Those Recommendations Pertaining to Administrative Personnel .....	75
11. Reaction of the Special Committee of the Department of Education to those Recommendations Pertaining to Facilities and Equipment .....	79
12. Official Reaction of the Department of Education to those Recommendations Pertaining to Facilities and Equipment .....	80



Table	Page
13. Reaction of the A.T.A. to those Recommendations Pertaining to Facilities and Equipment .....	82
14. Reaction of the Faculty of Education to those Recommendations Pertaining to Facilities and Equipment .....	82
15. The Degree of Implementation of Those Recommendations Pertaining to Facilities and Equipment .....	98
16. Official Reaction of the Department of Education to Those Recommendations Pertaining to Other Matters of Organization .....	104
17. Indian Student Enrolment 1937-69: Comparative Table .....	113
18. The Degree of Implementation of Those Recommendations Pertaining to Other Matters of Organization .....	117



## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure	Page
1. Conceptual Framework of the Study	6



## Chapter 1

### INTRODUCTION<sup>1</sup>

On December 31, 1957, the Honourable John J. Bowlen, Lieutenant Governor of the Province of Alberta, approved Order-in-Council 2009/57 establishing an Alberta Royal Commission on Education. The Commission was instructed to make "a. . . comprehensive survey of the various phases of the elementary and secondary school system of the province with particular attention to programs of study and pupil achievement." (Commission Report, 1959: 4) In detail, the Commission was to study:

- A. the aims and objectives essential to maintain a proper and adequate educational program;
- B. relative to the findings of A, above:
  1. curriculum,
  2. attainment, classification, and promotion of pupils,
  3. special services (guidance, provisions for gifted and handicapped, health services, and the like),
  4. types of school organization (centralized, composite, small high school, semester system, and the like),
  5. physical facilities (buildings),

---

<sup>1</sup>This is one of three theses dealing with the implementation of recommendations of the Cameron Commission. The theses of the other two researchers, R. Maddocks and A. Wilcer, are similar in format and approach to this thesis but deal with recommendations in different substantive areas.



6. quality and supply of teachers,
7. the relationship of the educational system to the requirements of industry and the modern community,
8. the economics of education, excluding a detailed study of sources and distribution of funds. (Clarke, 1960: 9-10)

The first regular meeting of the Commission was held on December 30, 1957. Within the next two years, the Commission heard approximately six hundred people present 189 briefs and propose more than five thousand recommendations. The Commission assembled a library of materials--books, pamphlets, and articles--which pertained to the terms of reference. It conducted, or directed to be conducted, six major research projects and numerous minor studies in areas where information was incomplete or lacking. More than one hundred consultants--both educational and non-educational--were called and the Commission held liaison meetings with Royal Commissions of Manitoba and British Columbia.

The inquiry outlined above resulted in the Report Of The Royal Commission on Education In Alberta which was presented to the Legislative Assembly on November 9, 1959. The report contains a majority presentation unanimously agreed to by five of the Commission members, namely Commissioners Cameron, Mowat, Hansen, Taylor, and Douglas, and a minority report signed by the sixth member, Commissioner Cormack.

The ensuing classification of the more than five thousand recommendations created considerable problems. The Commission Report indicated that:

The collective submissions indeed faced the Commission with a great mass of heterogeneous ideas. Upon receipt of only the first few briefs it was obvious that some of the topics in the terms of reference meant different things to different people. Conversely,



people expressed the same thoughts in various ways, the similarities not always being self-evident. Ideas ranged from broad generalizations about such matters as aims, curriculum and guidance to specific suggestions about discipline, the "curve" system, the age of entrance, manners and morals. Quite frequently specific recommendations were made regarding the means of achieving desirable results. It is little wonder, therefore, that the consolidation of specific suggestions from all submissions yielded more than 5,000 itemized proposals. (Commission Report, 1959: 9)

Working within the framework of its terms of reference, the Commission consolidated and evaluated opinion for each area within this framework. From this base, the final 280 recommendations of the majority report were formulated.

#### The Problem

As indicated above, the Royal Commission on Education represented a considerable investment of time and human and financial resources. Several questions could reasonably be posed regarding the precipitating causes and purposes of the Royal Commission on Education. Why was the Commission initially ordered? What forces initiated its formation and what forces were most instrumental in the formulation of the final recommendations? What did the Royal Commission accomplish? What were the concerns and issues in relation to the substantive areas of administrative-organizational features at the time of the Royal Commission as indicated by the recommendations and their origins and sources?

If it is assumed that answers to the above questions are possible, and if it is further assumed that the recommendations made by the Commission were valuable and that their adoption would improve the educational practices in the province, then it is of considerable



importance to know the extent to which these recommendations have been implemented. It is also of value to be able to determine the forces responsible for the implementation or non-implementation of the recommendations.

It was within the framework of these assumptions and the resulting questions that this study was undertaken.

### Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study was to provide information on the following general questions as they pertain to those recommendations of the Commission Report concerned with matters of organization and administration:

1. What forces or conditions were influential in the ordering of the Royal Commission on Education in 1957?
2. What were the origins and sources of the final recommendations of the Commission Report dealing with organization and administration and to what extent do these origins and sources reveal the concern at the time for these substantive areas?
3. What was the degree of acceptance of the recommendations?
4. To what extent have the recommendations been implemented and what factors might explain the varying degrees of implementation?

Information was also sought on a number of more specific questions. These specific questions are subcategories of the above four general questions and are more advantageously examined within the conceptual framework of the study which is illustrated in the following



section. For this reason, the more specific questions are enumerated following the development of the conceptual framework.

The substantive areas dealt with in this study pertaining to matters of organization and administration of personnel and facilities are areas of recurring importance. Knowledge of the forces and processes that initiate concern and change in these areas would be desirable. Similarly, knowledge of the concerns and issues pertaining to administration and organization in the era preceding the ordering of the Cameron Commission may prove useful for purposes of comparison with present and future concerns in these areas.

### Conceptual Framework

The conceptual framework of the study is illustrated schematically in Figure 1. The framework embodies the general theorizing regarding: the forces that gave rise to the Royal Commission; the origins and sources of the recommendations and the process by which recommendations are directed at various groups; the reactions of these groups in terms of approval or, conversely, non-approval of the recommendations; the actions taken by these groups in response to their above-mentioned reaction. The elements of the conceptual framework are described below.

The forces. For the purposes of this study the Royal Commission on Education was viewed as having been precipitated by certain social, economic, political and educational conditions or forces. It was further considered that these forces were significant enough to



SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL AND EDUCATIONAL CONDITIONS

FORCES

GROUPS, ORGANIZATIONS, INDIVIDUALS

SUBMISSIONS

ROYAL COMMISSION

ORIGINS  
AND  
SOURCES

RECOMMENDATIONS

DEPT. OF  
EDUCATION

A.T.A.

FACULTY  
OF  
EDUCATIONSCHOOL  
BOARDS

OTHERS

APPROVED

NOT APPROVED

REACTIONSIMPLEMENTED  
IN PARTIMPLEMENTED  
IN FULL

REJECTED

STILL UNDER  
CONSIDERATIONACTIONS

Figure 1. Conceptual Framework of the Study



have influenced the procedures and conclusions of the Royal Commission.

The origins and sources. The social, economic, political, and educational conditions of the time were considered to have prompted various groups, organizations, and individuals to make submissions to the Commission relating their views and recommendations on educational policy and practice. The Commission consolidated and evaluated these submissions and issued the final 280 recommendations of the majority report. For the purposes of this study, the concerns for the social, economic, political, and educational conditions were viewed as origins of the recommendations and the submissions made by various groups, organizations, and individuals were considered to be the sources of the recommendations.

The reactions. Once a recommendation was recognized by an organization as being within its power to implement, it was considered that the recommendation was either consistent or inconsistent with its policy and was, consequently, either approved or not approved in principle. As Figure 1 indicates, the approval or non-approval precipitates one of several actions which, for the purposes of this study, were defined as various degrees of implementation.

The actions. For the purposes of this study, the actions taken by the organizations are classified in terms of the degree of implementation of a recommendation. Within this framework, a reaction of approval can lead either to implementation in full or implementation in part. Similarly, a reaction of non-approval leads to either rejection



of the recommendation or a continuation of it under consideration by the organization.

#### Criteria For Assessing Degree of Implementation

One important consideration which was debated among the three researchers during the course of preparation for their studies on the recommendations of the Cameron Commission was the question of criteria by which recommendations might be categorized in terms of degree of implementation. The criteria subsequently adopted by all three researchers are defined in the following text.

Implementation of a recommendation was considered to have occurred when the practices intended by the recommendation were seen to be wholly or to some degree in accord with present practices as revealed by investigation.

Implementation in full was considered to have occurred when the practices intended by a recommendation were seen to be in full accord with actual practices. For example, recommendation 177 states:

That qualifications with force of law be established to govern eligibility for appointments of all superintendents in Alberta.

The practice intended by the recommendation is in full accord with actual practice as indicated by government regulations (August 15, 1968) which establish the necessary qualifications. (See Appendix F)

Included in this classification are recommendations for which the intended practices have been surpassed by actual practices in that particular area.

Implementation in part was considered to have occurred when practices intended by a recommendation were seen to be in less than full



accord with actual practices. In this category were placed (a) those recommendations for which implementation was deemed to be a continuous process and (b) those recommendations for which implementation was deemed to be proceeding towards a definite objective as indicated by the recommendation.

An example of a recommendation for which implementation is a continuous process is provided by recommendation number 187:

That as a service to local systems, the Department of Education sponsor continued study of the optimum assistant and special staff required to operate effectively schools of varying sizes.

The criteria based on school population established under the Grant Structure provide a basis for the assessment of the need for assistant and special staff and a continuous assessment is provided in that these criteria are periodically reviewed.

Recommendation number 191 provides an example of a recommendation for which implementation is proceeding towards a defined objective:

That as soon as qualified personnel are available, all school systems, rural and urban, initiate or extend guidance and counseling services to meet their needs.

Initial steps towards full implementation of this recommendation clearly awaits the availability of qualified personnel. As is pointed out in Chapter 4 of this report, full implementation of this recommendation is further hindered by a lack of exactness as to what constitutes "qualified" personnel.

A recommendation was considered to have been rejected when existing practices or policies of the group or groups to which the recommendation was directed were seen to be contrary to the intent of the recommendation.



For example, the intent of recommendation 255 is contrary to Alberta Teachers' Association policy and is, therefore, rejected by that organization:

Recommendation 255. That The Alberta Teachers' Association take the initiative in reassessing the obligations of teachers, vice-principals, principals and other members to give service beyond the normal period of ten months.

A.T.A. Policy 6.A.12 BE IT RESOLVED, that The Alberta Teachers' Association advocate that teachers not be required to teach more than six of eight full quarters nor be permitted to teach more than six consecutive quarters. (A.T.A. Members' Handbook, 1970: 191) (1969)

A recommendation was also classified as rejected if action was in accord with the intent of the recommendation but subsequent reversal of the action has resulted in present practices no longer being in accord with the intent of the recommendation. Such was the case with recommendation number 192:

That a plan be sponsored immediately by the Department of Education, trustees, teachers and the University, whereby the supply of qualified guidance personnel may be increased to meet present needs.

An incentive grant was established by the Department of Education in 1966 whereby local boards employing a counsellor three-quarters time or more received \$1500. This incentive grant was removed as of January 1, 1970.

A recommendation was considered to be still under consideration if practices and policies of the groups within whose power it was to implement the recommendation, while not necessarily contrary to the intent of the recommendation, are seen to be incompatible with the intent at this time. For example, recommendation 189 states:

That since specialized skills are required to perform the guidance function adequately, these services be withheld until suitable personnel are available.



The practices intended by this recommendation are incompatible with the policies and practices of the Department of Education, local boards, and teachers' associations. The urgency for guidance services has not been accompanied by the availability of the necessary personnel. Consequently, the attitude seems to be that some guidance is better than none. Although the practices intended by this recommendation may be recognized as desirable, existing conditions make its adoption impossible. However, the recommendation is still under consideration by the Department of Education, at least.

It is necessary to emphasize one very important aspect of the above four classifications of actions of the conceptual framework. While the present degree of implementation of each recommendation is defined in terms of the action taken in the substantive area of the recommendation, no attempt is made to imply that this action was made as a direct response to the particular recommendation. The problems inherent in such an implication are discussed in Chapter 7 and at this point it is emphasized that the actions described are not intended to be indicative of the degree of influence or impact of the Cameron Commission.

#### Sub-Questions of the Study

Each of the four levels of the conceptual framework, Forces, Origins and Sources, Reactions, and Actions, corresponds respectively to one of the four general questions identified earlier as the purpose of this research. At each of these levels, information was sought on a number of more specific questions:



1. Forces

- a. Can particular social, economic, political, or educational forces be identified as precipitating the ordering of the Royal Commission?
- b. Was the ordering of the Commission a direct response to a particular condition existing in 1957?
- c. Was the Commission a response to what might be referred to as the "climate" of the times?

2. Origins and Sources

- a. With respect to those recommendations pertaining to matters of organization and administration, what were the origins and sources of a specific recommendation?
- b. Was it made as a result of research conducted by the Commission, or by direction of the Commission?
- c. Was the recommendation made as a direct response to particular social, economic, political, or educational conditions or forces?

3. Reactions

- a. Which group or groups assumed the responsibility for implementation of the recommendation?
- b. Is the recommendation approved in principle or not by the group or groups at which it was directed?
- c. What factors might explain the approval or non-approval by the appropriate group or groups?

4. Actions

- a. What factors might explain the varying degrees of implementation of the recommendations? Did the recom-



mendation originate as a submission to the Commission from the implementing group?

- b. What factors would account for partial implementation and not full implementation?
- c. Did the group at which the recommendation was directed have the authority to implement it?
- d. Has there been a reversal of status of any recommendation from implemented to rejected or under review? Why?
- e. If under consideration, what factors are delaying a decision at this time?
- f. Is the recommendation still relevant?
- g. Is the nature of the recommendation itself responsible for lack of implementation--its specificity of intent or group at which it was directed?

#### Delimitations of the Study

The study was delimited to a consideration of those recommendations contained in Chapters 25, 28, and 29 of the original Report except for six recommendations from Chapter 29, numbers 242, 253, 254, 257, 258, and 259, which were investigated by one of the other members of the research team. The three chapters of the Report are titled, respectively, "Administrative Personnel," "Facilities and Equipment," and "Other Matters of Organization." The recommendations contained in these three chapters deal with the organization and administration of supervisory personnel, school time, and facilities. The chapter titled "Other Matters of Organization" also contains recommendations for specific organizational procedures relevant to specific minority groups in



Alberta, namely the Hutterites and native Indians. A list of those recommendations dealt with in the study is given in Appendix E.

The study was delimited in this manner since it was part of a larger research project in which two other investigators, A. Wilcer and R. Maddocks, were conducting a similar inquiry into recommendations from other chapters of the Report.

### Significance of the Study

The procedures of the Cameron Commission comprised an intensive and comprehensive research prompted by individuals and organizations that were concerned with the quality and scope of education in Alberta. The efforts associated with the investigation demanded a considerable investment of resources. The need exists to evaluate the extent to which the results and recommendations of such an investment are accepted by the society from which they originated and at which they are directed.

It is hoped that the findings of this study will contribute, in general, to the understanding of the process of change initiated by Royal Commissions. Specifically, it is hoped that the findings of this study will be of some value to present and future commissions on education.

### Collection of Data

A considerable portion of the data was collected through personal interviews. These interviews were recorded on tape and the relevant parts were later transcribed; some use was also made of telephone



interviews. Permission to use direct quotations from interviews as they appear in this report was granted by all interviewees. A list of the personal interviews conducted is given in Appendix A.

In addition to books, journal articles and newspaper reports, extensive use was made of official documents, briefs, policy statements, and provincial legislation and regulations. The original briefs submitted to the Cameron Commission, along with the minutes of regular and special meetings, are catalogued and filed in Central Files of the Department of Education.

Limited use was made of data collection by means of questionnaires. A questionnaire was not constructed since there was considerable diversity in the nature of the information sought from the various respondents. The questions posed were included as part of a letter which simultaneously served to introduce the researcher and the study being undertaken. A list of those who supplied relevant and useful information by this procedure is given in Appendix B.

#### Limitations of the Study

A considerable portion of the data used in the analysis was gathered through personal interviews. The reliability of data so gathered is always susceptible to the effects of the personal perceptions of those interviewed. The accuracy of responses was further limited in this study due to the time that had elapsed between the date of the interviews and the time about which information was sought. It is possible that this intervening time span not only influenced recall but it could also have affected the interviewee's interpretation of events, attitudes, and feelings.



A further limiting factor was the unavailability of official files and records. Several studies which may have been relevant to the recommendations under investigation were, for a number of reasons, unavailable or their whereabouts unknown.

A further limitation was the interpretation of official policies in terms of the recommendations of the Commission Report. In cases where policy statements had to be used to decide the degree of implementation of a recommendation the decision was made on the basis of the researcher's interpretation of the wording of the policy statement in terms of the implications of the recommendation.

#### Overview of Report

The first two general questions indicated under the purposes of this study are discussed in separate chapters. Chapter 2 is devoted to providing information on the question, "What forces or conditions were influential in the ordering of the Royal Commission on Education in 1957?" Chapter 3 provides detailed information in response to the second general question, "What were the origins and sources of the final recommendations of the Commission Report?"

The three following chapters, Chapters 4, 5, and 6, provide information on the remaining two general questions, "What was the degree of acceptance of the recommendations?" and "To what extent have the recommendations been implemented and what factors might explain the varying degrees of implementation?" The recommendations are placed into the three chapters of this study according to their appearance in Chapters 25, 28, and 29, of the Commission Report. Chapters 4, 5, and 6, of this study are given the same title as the corresponding chapters in the Report.



## Chapter 2

### FORCES AND CONDITIONS

The first general question on which this study was designed to provide information was, "What forces or conditions were influential in the ordering of the Royal Commission on Education in 1957?" This chapter provides information on this general question as well as the more specific questions posed under the section, "Forces," of the conceptual framework detailed in Chapter 1.

#### The Early Fifties

The early 1950's were a time of considerable optimism for the province of Alberta. In the late 1920's the Privy Council had returned all natural resources to the province. Chalmers detailed the effects of this development on the province of Alberta:

As a result, when the oil boom came, Alberta found itself the owner of about 90 per cent of all mineral rights within its boundaries. They soon made the Alberta government rich. Within less than 20 years, the province's cumulative oil revenue since 1947 had topped two billion dollars, nor was the end in sight. . . .

It was this newly discovered wealth that enabled Alberta to move into the Fifties with the confidence that all problems, no matter how serious, could be overcome. In retrospect, Albertans during this period seem to have been primarily interested in their own problems, little concerned with events beyond their own boundaries. In the field of education, one of their most urgent problems was to staff their schools. High hopes that the advent of peace would resolve their difficulties were doomed to disappointment. (Chalmers, 1967: 129-130)



A rapidly changing and expanding economy, however, created as many problems for educators as it solved. One of the aspects of the concept of a global community that contributed prominently to the educational atmosphere was the inability of geographical boundaries to control influence and interest. The influence of American methods and philosophies on the educational practices of the province had already been established before the fifties.

### The Influence of the United States

Chalmers (1967: 154-160) outlines a number of ideas for ". . . low-cost mass-production education which emerged from post-war American thinking . . . ." But the influx of new ideas did not solve the teacher shortage problem. Nor did it halt the spiraling costs of education.

Perhaps the American contribution which received the greatest public reaction was the progressivist philosophy which was widely held to be in fashion in the schools of Alberta.

Progressivism versus traditionalism. The concern over the relative merits of the progressivist and traditionalist philosophies provided the basis for considerable debate and inquiry into the state of education in Alberta.

During a recent interview, the present Deputy Minister of Education, T. C. Byrne, described the era prior to the ordering of the Commission as ". . . the days when the Department of Education was suspected of being filled with a hotbed of left-wing progressivists who were trying to shape the educational system, in a way that would water down the system, and we would end up with no substance or charac-



ter." (Interview, 1970)

Clarke (1968: 1-2) points out the incompatibility of the individualism, hard work, self-reliance concept of traditionalism and the stereotyped "soft, socialistic and self-destroying" interpretation of progressivism. Clarke describes education at the time, as the "battle-ground" between the traditionalists and progressivists.

A member of the Commission, G. L. Mowat, recently pointed out that despite considerable "scapegoating" there was a genuine concern on the part of the people that something of value had been lost in society. It may have been a reaction born out of frustration but the progressivist philosophy presented itself as a natural target for the aroused concern. Dr. Mowat went on to suggest that:

. . . educators were guilty of planting the seeds of anxiety among the public. They (educators) had for years emphasized the abandonment of old practice. In fact, however, although the labels on the can changed, the contents remained somewhat the same. Ironically, too much emphasis on new labels produced fears and reactions rather than acceptance among the public. (Interview, 1970)

The one Commissioner who did not sign the Majority Report, J. S. Cormack, submitted a Minority Report in which he provided a summary of the two conflicting philosophies. He pointed out their total incompatibility (Commission Report, 1959: 376), and stated his opposition to progressivism (Commission Report, 1959: 378-379). Despite his position, he concurred with H. E. Smith, former Dean of the Faculty of Education at the University of Alberta, that the interpretations and applications of the basic ideas of progressivism have been "extravagant and irrational" and that it was these "aberrations" that both provoked and merited the criticism directed at education in general. (Commission Report, 1959: 363) Cormack's inquiries further led him to recognize



that ". . . Alberta is not wedded to any one philosophy of education, but that it has retained what is best from the essentialist philosophy, and introduced much of what is good in the progressivist philosophy of education." (Commission Report, 1959: 361)

The futility of the debate was illustrated to the participants at the Edmonton City Convention in February, 1960 by J. MacDonald who stated that each philosophy has a contribution to make and the ". . . argument has gone on long enough, and has now reached the stage where it is hampering educational advance." (MacDonald, 1960: 68)

Similarly, Senator D. A. Cameron, expressed his impatience with the debate:

It is rather unfortunate and even pathetic to see people waxing hot and furious over whether recommendations of the majority report and the commissioners who made them, must be labelled as being either progressivist or traditionalist, whatever that may mean. And I am sure it means different things to different people. The important point is that education has become so important in terms of national welfare and the survival of a way of life that we cannot afford to dissipate our energies in a witless attempt to classify one group of people as traditionalists and therefore good, and another group as progressivists and therefore bad. Let us admit at once that there are many good things in both traditional and in the so-called progressive education, and wise people will try to combine the best of both to make something richer than either. (Cameron, 1960: 8)

The political aspect of the progressivist-traditionalist struggle was too significant to be ignored. Dr. G. Mowat, recalling the public furore over the progressivist movement, stated that:

. . . Partially as a result of this clamor, which took on political overtones, the government decided to establish a commission --perhaps to let the public know and to reassure it that the government wasn't oblivious to public concerns. (Interview, 1970)

R. E. Rees, the present Associate Deputy Minister of Education and Chief Superintendent of Schools, in a recent interview, outlined his work as Secretary to the Cameron Commission. In discussing the



ferment and criticism of education at the time, he indicated that the ordering of the Commission

... reassured people that here was a responsible, competent, interested and well-informed group who were making every effort to sort out what was right, what was wrong, and what should be the course of education. I think it instilled a great deal of confidence in Albertans. (Interview, 1970)

The impact of Russian technological supremacy. The reaction in Alberta to the Russian space achievements of 1957 was typical of that of most of the Western world and was possibly a reflection of the extreme concern expressed in the American reaction. In this respect, the American influence was as real as that which centered around the progressivist-traditionalist debates.

The orbiting of the Russian satellite occurred at a specific point in time, and, consequently, was a convenient event for those inclined towards the pointing of fingers. But the development of a global concept of the world community had begun long before that event.

An editorial in The A.T.A. Magazine reflected the feelings of the times:

But time is running out. We of the Western World don't have the monopoly or 'know-how' we thought we had. We can no longer afford to squander the brain power latent in our children. The blasts of the Soviet Sputniks have hammered home, as no other lessons have, that education is our first line of defence. (The A.T.A. Magazine, 1957: 5)

As in the United States, public reaction to the Russian achievements focused attention on the schools. MacDonald (1960: 15) pointed out that when society awakens to the recognition of undesirable circumstances it inevitably "... finds their origin in the state of education, and the schools have to bear the blame for everything from payola through juvenile delinquency to the inanities of the American space



program."

The Brief of the Alberta Teachers' Association to the Royal Commission on Education made reference to a recent national concern over the shortage of engineering and scientific personnel and suggested that such a concern is

... particularly appropriate today, when the country's economic buoyance is somewhat less than it was a few years earlier and when the intense international competition between Russia and the Free World has provoked a concern for science and education bordering on a crusade and at times hysteria. (A.T.A. Brief, 1958: 13)

The Alberta Teachers' Association was certainly not absent from the crusade. An editorial in The A.T.A. Magazine (1956: 6) points to the ability of the ". . . cold and implacable efficiency of the Russian educational system in producing not only the type, but sufficient numbers of persons required by the state . . ." and warns that the survival of our way of life depends on educating people in the technical skills and the democratic concept. The warning ends on a most foreboding note:

Make no mistake--this is the price of our national survival in a do-or-die age.

Instead of leisurely, 'waltz-me-around-Willie' discussions on federal and provincial responsibilities, including federal aid, the can-we-afford-it-or-can't-we attitude, shoddy substitutes, endless emergency programs, scholarly dissertations on what is wrong with our schools, we need bold, imaginative, and, most of all, decisive action, for, if it doesn't come soon, the chances are we won't be needing it in the future. (The A.T.A. Magazine, 1956: 6)

The impact of the Russian advances in the technological and scientific sphere was certainly evident within the membership of the Cameron Commission. Senator Donald A. Cameron delivered the keynote address to mark the official opening of Education Week in Alberta in



1960 and in it he cautioned that ". . . the scientific revolution of today will change the world even more than the Industrial Revolution and we are letting the Russians lead the way . . . ." (Cameron, 1960: 10)

#### Other Commissions on Education

As mentioned, the reaction of the people of Alberta was not unique at that time. While the Cameron Commission was conducting its review of education in Alberta, similar Royal Commissions were in existence in the provinces of British Columbia and Manitoba. The Cameron Commission reflected Alberta's sharing in a concern for education that existed throughout much of the Western world. This widespread concern was clearly identified by Senator D. Cameron:

The great debate about education is healthy and good. It is a sign that more and more people are becoming concerned about education, about its aims, its quality, and its results, and its costs. As an evidence of this concern, and of government's anxiety to do something about it, five Royal Commissions have been established by provincial governments in Canada in the past 15 years. In the United States Dr. James B. Conant has just completed an exhaustive, first-hand study of the American high school. The State of California has just completed the Larsen report, a five-year examination of teachers' qualifications and program content. At the adult level, the Carnegie Corporation and Ford Foundation have sponsored two five-year studies on the content, quality, and results of the programs for management training being conducted in the nation's business schools. In Canada, a joint committee of the Canadian Chamber of Commerce and the Canadian Association for Adult Education has started a study to examine the needs in management training and to see how well we are meeting them. In Great Britain, the Crowther report on education has just come off the press. And for those experts who have, in their wisdom, suggested that the Alberta report was unduly long when, including a lengthy minority dissent, it totalled 451 pages, let them look at the Hope Report in Ontario with 933 pages, or the Crowther Report in England with 519. (Cameron, 1960: 7)



### The Press

A study by Worth (1955) analyzed the editorials on education, published by the six daily newspapers of Alberta, during the five-year period from 1946 to 1950. One finding of the study was that a possible lack of information on the objectives of the schools had contributed to a number of misconceptions--such as that schools had forgotten the "three R's"--that were popularly associated with progressive education.

The ordering of the Commission may have been designed, in part, to reassure the public but the final Report did little to appease the press; the press was hostile. The reactions of the press to the Commission's Report indicate the discrepancy between the editorialized expectations for the Cameron Commission and the actual direction assumed in the final Report.

An editorial in the Calgary Herald announced the public release of the Commission Report with the heading, "THEY MISSED THE BOAT." Rather than correct the educational system of the Province, the Report was viewed as a deliberate attempt to

. . . entrench every aspect of the progressive philosophy, with a few minor exceptions in our school system.

We ourselves had hoped for much from the report; but the reality leaves us considerably worse off than the man who asked for bread and was given a stone.

The Edmonton Journal in a November 23 editorial entitled "Central Issue Avoided" voices similar disappointment:



Yet the commission has failed to strike at the roots of the basic cause of the deterioration of education--the "progressivist" philosophy and methods--and in this respect it has fallen far short of public wishes and public demand. The task of rooting out the "progressivist" influence in the department of education, the faculty of education and the teaching corps remains, since the commission has skirted and, indeed, avoided it.

The editor of the Southam press had stated his position against the progressivist philosophy in Alberta's educational system before the ordering of the Commission. The Report was not what he had hoped for. As Dr. Mowat illustrated:

He, and other critics who saw the Alberta education system as a hot-bed of progressive education, were undoubtedly disappointed that the Report, as a whole, did not confirm explicitly the existence of rampant progressivism and the errors of its ways. (Interview, 1970)

The severity of the treatment by the press of the Commission Report and of education in general prior to the release of the Commission's findings, prompted the Alberta Teachers' Association and the Alberta School Trustees' Association to unite in a direct protest to the headquarters of the Southam Press in Montreal. This joint communiqué protested the "treatment of education and especially of the Cameron Commission Report." The "unfair" and "irresponsible" action on the part of "monopoly newspapers" was indicated as having "dealt a severe and untimely blow to the welfare of public education in Alberta." When, the protest demanded, "does freedom of the press become license of the press?"

#### Public Attitudes

One of the terms of reference of the Commission was to determine "the impact of community attitudes on education." (Commission Report, 1959: 5) The importance of public attitude is concisely summarized by



the following statement from the Alberta Teachers' Association's Brief to the Alberta Royal Commission on Education (1958: 13): "No aspect of education can be properly considered apart from the society it serves."

The real question involves the nature of the public attitude.

The expectations and reactions of the press have already been discussed but questions arise as to what extent this was an accurate reflection of the general attitude of the public and to what extent the press influenced the public attitude. On these questions the evidence is not conclusive.

The Commission Report (1959: 9-10) indicated:

There was evidence of a conviction that public attitudes towards education generally, and teachers particularly, must be changed--for example:

1. The schools are hindered by public apathy towards many objectives held by the schools.
2. The public must assume greater responsibility in many matters which it tends to assign wholly to the schools.
3. Community attitudes and adult behaviour generally are to be deplored as contributing to a lack of mental and physical discipline, poor work and study habits, and a general weakening of a sense of responsibility, manners and morals.

The Report (1959: 42) adds that, frequently, ". . . education is reduced to the status of a 'good thing' but not one which has priority over other immediate needs." The sentiment is also expressed that the public typically looks to the schools to offer instruction or provide the appropriate measures to rectify any social condition from lax morals and religious interest to juvenile delinquency.

A study by Worth (1955) concluded that newspaper editors succeed in reflecting and directing public opinion about education to a significant degree. His study was based on an examination of the editorials of the six Alberta daily newspapers from 1946-1950.



Another study (Black et al., 1960) was conducted in Alberta in 1958. At the time, Black was a Research Director for the Cameron Commission and the investigation reported here centered around an attempt to ascertain public awareness of the workings of the Commission. Among the conclusions of the study were the following:

There is one finding of this study that stands out above all others. This is the evident lack of interest of the sampled population in their schools. Sizeable proportions of the sampled group within the limitations of the survey method could neither criticise nor state one good feature of the schools nor make a single suggestion for their improvement. The establishment of a Royal Commission to study the status of education in Alberta has not created a marked demonstration of the typical citizen's interest in education even though the press and radio coverage of this Commission's activities has been considered generally to be excellent.

In brief, this study has shown that the average citizen is not inordinately interested in the public educational system and it may follow as a corollary that the reported outbursts and attacks on education are perhaps the product of a vocal and informed minority.

. . . the total population sampled in this study was found as a group to be unable or unwilling to commend their schools. (Black et al., 1960: 35)

It is significant to note that the last finding quoted above was not a universal finding of the Commission. The impact of the general public attitude of apathy and lack of awareness was somewhat lessened by numerous individuals during the course of the public hearings conducted by the Commission. Even though dissatisfaction existed with certain aspects, individuals repeatedly acknowledged the advances made in education. The Commission brought out the quiet sector of the public who felt that there was much that was good with the present school system. It had provided an outlet for counteracting opinions that tended to neutralize. (Mowat, interview, 1970)

There is some evidence that the general public attitude was



precipitated by a consideration, if not an apprehension, of the many rapid changes that were occurring in Alberta's society at the time. The remainder of this chapter is devoted to a brief consideration of some of these changes and the effect they may have had on the general public feelings of loss of something of value in society and dissatisfaction with the schools and their product.

### A Changing Economic Base

One change in the Alberta Community which contributed significantly to the general feelings of loss in society and dissatisfaction with the schools was the rapidly expanding economic base. A survey prepared by the Alberta Bureau of Statistics for the Department of Industry and Development concluded:

The past ten years have witnessed important changes in Alberta's production pattern. These changes have taken place rapidly; the productive base has altered immensely. For almost fifty years this province has been regarded primarily as a producer of agricultural products. However, the growth in manufacturing, mineral production and construction has revolutionized the productive structure of the province. Relatively more reliance is placed on processing and mining industries at present than in the past. Upon this broader deployment of resources depends the general economic well-being of the province. (Department of Industry and Development, 1959: 7)

The absolute value of agricultural production was remaining relatively stable; what was undergoing dramatic change was the relative importance of the value of this production. Table 1 illustrates the comparative stagnation of the agricultural economy and the considerable advancement of the construction, mining, and manufacturing industries. In 1946, agriculture accounted for approximately fifty-two percent of the net value of productivity in the major areas of economic activity while, in 1956, this relative value had dropped to approximately



twenty-seven percent.

Table 1. Net Values of Productivity in the Major Areas of Economic Activity. (Calgary Power Report, 1958: 8)

	1946	1956
	(millions of dollars)	
Agriculture	249	397
Mining (includes oil and gas)	65	373
Manufacturing	84	292
Construction	65	399
Forest Products	5	9
Electric Power	9	35

As recently as 1941, half the Alberta labour force was involved in agriculture. By 1957, this proportion was less than 30 percent and continuing to decline. (Calgary Power Report, 1958: 64)

This broadening of the economic base was of vital importance to the economic stability of the province. A significant decline in the agricultural sector of the economy in the late 1920's was a serious blow to Alberta; a decline of near equal magnitude in the early 1950's had less overall effect. The contributions to the economy of the newer industries were so significant that, despite the agricultural decline, the net production value of the Alberta economy still increased. (Government of Alberta, Brief to the Gordon Commission on Canada's Economic Prospects, 1955: 32)

The Calgary Power Report in summarizing its forecasts of future



growth, predicted that

. . . the economic development of the province will attract people from other provinces and from other countries, so that the population is quite sure to grow more rapidly than the natural increase alone would indicate. This increase in population will induce growth in secondary industry and services. Heavier industry will develop. The discovery of further mineral ores would be an added impetus. It seems certain that the Alberta economy will continue to grow at a rapid pace up to 1975, and perhaps for many more years. Growth after 1975, however, may be partly dependent on the successful establishment of new secondary manufacturing industries between now and that time. (1958: 239)

A changing economic base required a changing educational preparation. The Brief of the Canadian Petroleum Association to the Cameron Commission (1958: 2) outlined this changing need:

Because of the increasing complexity of operations and the growth of automation, unskilled labor has almost disappeared in the industry and the need for people of higher educational attainment grows continually even in non-professional occupations.

A study entitled "Educational Needs as Viewed by Selected Alberta Manufacturers" was conducted by H. J. Uhlman under direction of the Cameron Commission. Amongst the needs expressed by the representative of the manufacturing industry were the following:

. . . a generally felt need for more young people with ten or more years of schooling as job holders at the lower levels of employment to provide candidates for positions of increasing responsibility in future years;

. . . an urgent need for more years of schooling for skilled employees in the growing number of jobs calling for mental as well as manual skills;

. . . a pressing need for technicians, skilled maintenance personnel, and supervisory staffs. (Commission Report, 1959: 351-5)

The Alberta Government's Brief to the Gordon Commission stressed (1955: 269) that the need for professional engineers was made even more acute by the shortage of technicians. Sufficient numbers of such personnel were necessary to relieve engineers forced to perform marginal



tasks and routine work.

The Brief went on to predict that within the next five years in the field of Vocational Education an estimated \$800,000 would be necessary to provide adequate facilities. (1955: 270)

The rapidly changing demands of industry posed a considerable problem to those charged with designing curricula to meet these demands. Byrne pointed out that:

Local authorities, outside the major cities, not being able to provide the facilities for technical and vocational training, chose to stress the university and normal entrance courses. Experience with the technical curriculum in the cities indicated that students thus trained had not been able to step into positions more readily than their more academically educated colleagues and that many, ill-adjusted to bookish subjects, were equally misfitted in the vocational areas. (Byrne, 1959: 69)

In its brief to the Cameron Commission, the Alberta Teachers' Association, pointed out that the divergent demands of industry, the fluctuating economic conditions, and other factors had contributed to a lack of clarity as to the appropriate role of the Vocational Education curriculum in the school. (1958: 130)

This ambiguity of demands and roles led the Faculty of Education in its Brief to the Commission to conclude:

Until such time as employers have clearly defined the specific training they require of junior and senior high school graduates, it appears that the school program should be directed more toward sound general education and the development of socially competent persons than toward the development of specific knowledge and competencies for particular occupations. (1958: 21-22)

The foregoing discussion indicates the direct effect that the changing economic base had on the expectations of the public for the educational system. More accurately, perhaps, it indicates the uncertainty that this rapid change instilled into the climate of the times. Of equal importance are the indirect effects of a changing economic



base--changing population patterns and the quality of rural education.

### Population Patterns and Rural Education

Increases in population and increases in urbanization necessitated by the rapid industrialization of the province led to rapid increases in enrolment in urban schools. The percentage of people living in urban areas increased markedly in the 1946-1956 decade. (Commission Report, 1959: 14-21)

Not only were the population patterns affected by the migration to the urban centers but the patterns were also altered by a significant change in the age distribution following World War II. Considering increased population and increased holding power of the schools, the trend developed wherein the proportion of school children to the total population was increasing and the indicated trend was for further increases; this placed a considerable strain on the educational facilities. The increased cost of education was made even more visible by this development in the population pattern because it meant, in effect, that relatively fewer people, the labour force, had to pay for a growing quantity of education. (Alberta Government, Brief to the Gordon Commission, 1955: 259-262)

Chalmers indicates the visibility of these increased costs and the public reaction to them:

By the end of World War II and the 1944-45 school year, at \$85.49 Alberta's average annual cost per pupil, based on enrolment, was a startling 154 per cent of the low figure of depression days, and the cry of the taxpayer was heard through the land. Yet this was not the worst. Within five years this figure had almost doubled, to \$157.08; within ten it had reached the all-time high of \$229.13. (Chalmers, 1967: 134)



The problem of providing adequate educational facilities to the children in rural areas was causing considerable public concern in the late 1950's. With the disappearance of the small farm and the increased migration to urban centers, the centralization of educational facilities was proving more and more difficult. The Commission Report (1959: 252-254) suggested that serious consideration be given to the possible educationally weakening effects of one such centralization attempt, the County System.

Perhaps the most comprehensive analysis of the problem of rural education in the 1950's was a thesis, "A Study of the Impact of Demographic and Economic Changes in Rural Alberta on the Financing of Education," completed at the University of Alberta in 1958 by H. J. Uhlman. A monograph, based on the thesis, was published by the Alberta Advisory Committee on Educational Research titled "Rural Alberta: Patterns of Change" by the same author. (Uhlman, 1961)

One of the most striking points brought to light was that the educational needs of rural children were not significantly different from the needs of their urban counterparts. Because the majority of rural-educated children would be absorbed into the urban labour force, the education they received must be designed to facilitate this absorption. He states:

Alberta's rapid economic expansion, particularly during the past decade, has required a growing army of workers, many of whom have been supplied by rural communities. The important thing then is not to educate rural children "to the farm" or "away from the farm", but to recognize the breadth of the problem as provincial, or even national, and to develop means to finance the type of education that will be of maximum benefit to society and to all industries comprising the economy.

Uhlman adds:



There is less difference among the types of employment opportunities open to rural and urban young people in Alberta today than there was twenty-five years ago. Increased facilities for population movements have made the province one large community as far as mobility of the labour force is concerned. (1961: 77)

The author concluded that it was no longer realistic to retain the rural-urban distinction within society, particularly with regard to education:

If surplus rural youth are to be employable, they must have access to a kind of education which is adequate for urban society. There can no longer be a rural-urban distinction: the products of the school must be interchangeable. (1961: 105)

Uhlman also expressed concern over the financing of rural education and the provision of rural vocational high schools. The rural areas continued to press for action on these points even after the publishing of the Commission Report. (Ponting, 1960: 7-9)

#### DISCUSSION

In the province, the general feelings of dissatisfaction with the schools and of instability and loss of something of value in society (Mowat, interview, 1970) were amplified by a rapidly changing economic base which redefined the educational requirements of the people of the province. As is often the case, the schools were simultaneously blamed for present undesirable situations and charged with the responsibility of providing solutions to existing problems in society. The social and economic implications of the changes which were occurring in Alberta's economy not only redefined the educational requirements but precipitated numerous questions as to what were the most suitable organizational practices to coordinate the school system with these rapid changes and



developments.

The educational forces appear to have been as much a response to the progressivist-traditionalist controversy as to the changing social and economic demands. One outstanding concern, however, was for the quality and scope of the educational opportunities provided for rural students. This one area of concern illustrates, perhaps more vividly than any other, the interdependence of the social, economic, political, and educational forces. No longer could the province be thought of, from an educational viewpoint, as containing distinct rural and urban areas. In fact, the developing perspective necessitated the disregard of geographical and political boundaries as far as educational preparation was concerned.

Whether or not the social, economic, political, or educational conditions detailed in this chapter can be directly identified as being responsible for the ordering of the Commission depends clearly, in many cases, on personal interpretation. What is clear, however, is that the reaction of the people of Alberta was not unique at that time. The mood was reflected in numerous inquiries into educational practices throughout much of the Western world.

Although no single force can be identified as having clearly "caused" the ordering of the Cameron Commission, the forces detailed in this chapter can be considered to have contributed to the climate of the times and, from this perspective, the Commission can be viewed as a reaction to this climate.

Thus, the Cameron Commission was not precipitated by various social, economic, political, or educational forces considered in iso-



lation but by the effects of numerous factors and conditions combined to form a global concept of the climate of the times.

#### SUMMARY

This chapter has indicated some of the trends that existed during the era preceding the ordering of the Cameron Commission that contributed to the climate of the times. It was within this climate that the turmoil arose within Alberta that eventually led to the ordering of an inquiry into the state of education in Alberta.

The early nineteen fifties were characterized by considerable optimism that the educational problems of the province could easily be solved. The opening sections of this chapter indicated some of the visible signs that these early hopes were not being fulfilled. The era preceding the ordering of the Cameron Commission was characterized by considerable debate over the relevancy of the educational system and the quality of its products. The debate was most visibly apparent in the progressivist-traditionalist controversy. The later sections of this chapter indicate the rapid changes that were occurring in Alberta's society at that time which contributed to a large degree to the general feelings of dissatisfaction with the school system.



## Chapter 3

### ORIGINS AND SOURCES OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS

For the purposes of this study, the definition of the origins of a recommendation was subjected to interpretation in two ways. First, concern pertaining to the substantive matter contained within a recommendation can be considered to have originated from within society as a result of the various forces and conditions detailed in Chapter 2. These forces and conditions were considered as ORIGINS of a particular recommendation.

Second, when viewed from the perspective of having had a direct influence on the Commission's decision to include a particular recommendation in the final Report, the recommendation was considered to have been expressed in a submitted brief, a hearing, or in other direct sources available to the Commission. For the purposes of this study, these direct submissions were considered as SOURCES of a particular recommendation.

For the recommendations dealt with in the study, this chapter provides information on the sources and origins as they are defined above.



## SOURCES OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS

Limitations in Identifying the Sources

In attempting to identify the sources of the various recommendations dealt with in this study, one limitation constantly arose which may have resulted in possible errors of interpretation by the researcher. While it was recognized that this limitation may have affected the accuracy of the results, the introduction of this possible error was unavoidable. The possible error arose in attempting to match the wording of the recommendations as it appeared in the Commission Report with the wording of the recommendations as it appeared in the various briefs presented to the Commission.

The situation was further complicated by the fact that a number of recommendations originated from the discussions which arose during the presentations of the briefs by the submitting groups or individuals. Also, a number of recommendations originated from research conducted by the Commission. Possible error on the part of the researcher in the interpretation of the wording of the recommendations is further complicated by the personal interpretations of the persons presenting the recommendations. This problem was recognized by the members of the Commission during their consideration of the classification of the submitted recommendations:

... it was obvious that some of the topics in the terms of reference meant different things to different people. Conversely, people expressed the same thoughts in various ways, the similarities not always being self-evident. . . . It is little wonder, therefore, that the consolidation of specific suggestions from all submissions yielded more than 5,000 itemized proposals. (Commission Report, 1959: 9)



In view of the above, it was not expected that the introduction of the researcher's interpretation would seriously limit the validity of the results.

### The Royal Commission Compilation

Early in the Commission's proceedings an assistant, A. F. Brown, was employed to aid the Commission secretary, R. E. Rees, with the classification and compilation of the presented recommendations. The method of identifying the sources of recommendations used in this study follows that employed in the Commission compilation. For this reason, a description of the procedures adopted is provided.

In a recent correspondence with A. F. Brown (April 2, 1970), he described the main part of the compilation as a set ". . . of 5000 McBee Key Sort Cards on which were transcribed all recommendations, stated and implied, in the various Briefs, transcripts of hearings, written statements, commissioned research and information files of the Royal Commission . . . ."

Brown provided a photocopy of the master card which indicates (see Appendix C) that:

. . . every recommendation was indexed five times, (1) substantively, i.e. according to the substantive classification derived primarily from the terms of reference, (2) school subject matter categories, (3) the Brief number where applicable, (4) the type of sources, (5) "Horizontal" categories, or topics or issues which cut across the other classification system.

The "horizontal" categories include whether the recommendation represented lay information, professional information, or had been researched.

Unfortunately, the whereabouts of these 5000 cards is presently



unknown. When the Commission disbanded, the cards were apparently deposited, along with the bulk of the Commission files, at Central Files at the Department of Education. They were then moved several times and the researcher was able to trace their movement to the Faculty of Education Library, University of Alberta, Edmonton. It appears as if they had been misplaced during the construction of the new library facilities.

However, much the same information that is provided on the cards is available in summary form, prepared by Dr. Brown, filed at Central Files. This summary contains an indexing of essentially the same information contained on the master card. It also contains summaries of most of the 5000 original recommendations as well as the sources from which they were derived.

It was not always possible to identify clearly the sources of the final recommendations of the Commission Report due to the wording of the summaries. Also, a number of the final recommendations were definitely absent from the summary. An examination of the individual briefs and the transcripts of regular Commission meetings and of presentation hearings revealed the sources of most recommendations.

Since sources were differentiated on the basis of being lay or professional in nature, it is significant to note the criteria accepted in order to classify a recommendation as having originated from a professional source as opposed to a lay source:

Professional Opinion: backed up by professional observation or experience.

All educators' recommendations are classed as "Professional." All recommendations from non-educators who are recommending within their own professional field when referring to an educational matter are classed "Professional", e.g. architects, on materials used for school construction; optometrists, on visual testing in the schools.



Lay Opinion: backed up by lay observation or experience.  
(Brown, Summary: 6)

The criteria for a researched recommendation is less rigid: ". . . backed up by some sort of research or investigation." A second correspondence from Brown (April 17, 1970), responded to questions regarding the exact criteria used in classifying a recommendation as being based on research and the applicability of the research to Alberta:

I do not recall specific criteria which were used to class a recommendation as "researched" but you must remember at the time I was midway through a heavily research-orientated Ph.D. program and would likely have been using a criterion much more rigorous than those which are normally in vogue in the profession i.e. there would have to have been evidence of an actual research project for the classifications to have been used; naturally enough the quality of research is a different variable altogether and the classification would have been used even though there may have been defects in the actual research design. Hopefully this would have been taken into consideration in the compilation wording.

Brown also pointed out that all the research did not apply to the Alberta scene.

#### Adaptation For This Study

The compilation prepared by Brown was adapted for use in this study to identify the sources of recommendations. In addition to the adjustments mentioned previously which were necessitated by either the wording of the summaries or the complete absence of reference to a number of recommendations, two other differences exist between Brown's summary and the compilation used in this study.

The first difference was imposed by the delimitations of this study. Since only sixty-three of the total 280 recommendations were investigated, the total number of references given in Brown's summary will be considerably more than the number given in this study.



The second difference arose from an attempt to include only those sources that the researcher judged to have had the most influence on the Commission's final recommendations. This procedure can be justified on at least two grounds. Firstly, a number of the recommendations in the final report appear word-for-word as they appeared in presented briefs or as they were spoken during presentations. Secondly, considerable reference is made to briefs presented by educators. Mowat pointed out that the views expressed by educators had a considerable impact on the Commission members. He expressed the opinion that lay members of the Commission

• . . were generally more impressed with the views of educators than with those of lay groups or of the prominent critics. In the last analysis, educators not only were aware of problems in public education but were capable of suggesting solutions. (Mowat, interview, 1970)

In the compilation which follows, briefs are referred to by numbers; the numbering used is the original numbering of the briefs used by the Commission. The complete list of the briefs referred to in this study is given in Appendix D. Similarly, the recommendations are referred to by number only. These are numbered as in the Commission Report and a list of the ones used in this study is given in Appendix E.

The following coding was used in referring to the sources of the recommendations:

Br. Written Brief, submitted and heard before the Commission.

Tr. Transcript of the hearing given a written brief.

Lay Refers to a lay source as previously described.

Prof. Refers to a professional source as previously described.

Res. Refers to a researched source as previously described.



Thus, for example, a source identified as Br. 34, p 2 (prof) (res), would indicate that the source of the recommendation was: Brief 34, specifically page 2, professional, and researched. A source identified as Tr. 34, p 1 (prof), would indicate that the source of the recommendation was: page 1 of the transcript of the hearing during which Brief 34 was presented and it is professional.

The following three tables summarize the sources of the recommendations dealt with in this study according to the Brown compilation adapted as described. The recommendations are grouped by tables according to the chapter of this study in which their degree of implementation is described. As mentioned in Chapter 1, some recommendations were treated as groups for the purpose of determining the degree of implementation. This same practice is employed in the following tables for the determination of sources.



Table 2. Sources of Recommendations Pertaining to Administrative Personnel

Number	Source
175	Br. 11, p 69 (prof); Tr. 11, pp 3,6 (prof)
176	Br. 12, p 3,4 (lay); Tr. 12, p 1,17 (lay)
177	Br. 34, pp 24,30 (prof); Br. 36, p 6 (prof)
178	Br. 66, pp 110-113 (prof); Br. 71, pp 10,12,23,
179	27 (prof); Br. 155, p 2 (lay); Tr. 156, p 3 (prof)(res)
180	Br. 6, p 7 (lay); Br. 7, p 12 (lay);
181	Br. 12, p 5 (lay); Br. 25, p 22 (lay)
182	Br. 34, p 27 (prof); Br. 66, pp 71,104,113 (prof)
183	Br. 71, p 28 (prof); Br. 89, pp 8,9 (prof)
186	Br. 163, p 2 (lay)
187	
184	Br. 11, pp 30,124 (prof); Tr. 12, p 1 (lay) Br. 66, p 40 (prof); Br. 71, pp 2,10-14 (prof) Tr. 155, p 1 (lay)
185	Tr. 11, pp 3,6 (prof); Tr. 12, p 17 (lay) Br. 34, pp 24,30 (prof); Tr. 36, p 6 (prof) Br. 71, pp 10,23 (prof); Tr. 156, p 3 (prof)(res)
188	Tr. 6, p 4 (lay); Br. 11, pp 95,96 (prof)
to	Tr. 11, p 5 (prof); Br. 12, pp 2,12 (lay)
194	Br. 24, pp 24,40,41 (prof)(res); Br. 66, p 151 (prof)(res); Br. 71, p 13 (prof); Tr. 82, p 13 (lay)
195	
196	

## Code:

Br. Written Brief, submitted and heard before the Commission  
 Tr. Transcript of the hearing given a written brief  
 Lay Refers to a lay source  
 Prof. Refers to a professional source  
 Res. Refers to a researched source



Table 3. Sources of Recommendations Pertaining to Facilities and Equipment

Number	Source
221	Br. 4, p 4 (prof); Br. 34, p 100 (prof) Br. 66, p 72 (prof);
222	Br. 1, pp 4-8 (prof); Br. 11, p 107 (prof)
223	Br. 66, pp 72,177 (prof); Br. 71, p 27 (prof)
224	Br. 5, p 6 (lay); Br. 12, p 15 (lay) Br. 13, p 13 (lay); Br. 92, p 4 (lay) Br. 140, p 2 (lay); Br. 154, pp 5,6 (lay)
225	Br. 6, p 16 (lay); Br. 12, p 20 (lay)
226	Br. 92, p 6 (prof); Tr. 114, p 18 (lay)
227	
228	Br. 6, p 17 (lay); Br. 7, p 12 (prof)
to	Tr. 7, pp 1,2 (prof); Br. 8, p 2 (lay)
233	Br. 11, p 70 (prof); Br. 34, pp 18,62,68,107 (prof)
234	Br. 60, p 4 (lay); Br. 66, pp 73,103,110 (prof)
235	Tr. 80, p 3 (prof); Tr. 102, p 4 (lay)
237	Br. 140, p 1 (lay); Br. 154, p 4 (lay)
238	Br. 169, p 1 (lay)
239	Br. 11, p 71 (prof)(res); Tr. 12, p 2 (lay)
to	Br. 12, p 2,7 (lay); Br. 32, p 2 (lay)(res)
249	Br. 32, pp 5-8 (lay); Br. 34, pp 38,100 (prof)
	Br. 66, pp 73,77 (prof); Br. 107, p 1 (prof)
234	
250	
251	

Code:

Br. Written Brief, submitted and heard before the Commission  
 Tr. Transcript of the hearing given a written brief  
 Lay Refers to a lay source  
 Prof. Refers to a professional source  
 Res. Refers to a researched source



Table 4. Sources of Recommendations Pertaining to Other Matters of Organization

Number	Source
255	
256	
260	Br. 105, (lay)
261	
262	
263	
264	Br. 92, (prof); Tr. 92, (prof)
265	
266	
267	

Code:

Br. Written Brief, submitted and heard before the Commission  
Tr. Transcript of the hearing given a written brief  
Lay Refers to a lay source  
Prof. Refers to a professional source  
Res. Refers to a researched source



### The Effect of Informal Interaction

The three tables indicate that, within the limitations mentioned due to personal interpretations, the origin for all the recommendations dealt with in this study have been identified except for the following eight: 195, 196, 234, 236, 250, 251, 255, 256. The assumption was made throughout that the existence of a recommendation in a particular brief or transcript was sufficient evidence to conclude that this existence created sufficient influence on the Commission members so as to affect the decision as to whether the recommendation should be made and how it should be worded. It would be difficult to demonstrate total absence of influence, negative or positive, and, except for minor instances, it was impossible to demonstrate the influence of private discussions, interviews with consultants, and any other interaction of the informal organization of which no official record exists.

This very situation may possibly account for the sources of the eight unclassified recommendations. It is possible that these recommendations are the results of conclusions arrived at by the Commission during the course of the consideration of all the evidence and they need not have been expressed by any particular group or individual in the form in which they appeared in the Commission Report.

### ORIGINS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS

Although it would be difficult to identify a single force or condition as solely responsible for the ordering of the Cameron Commission, it is possible that a single force, or group of forces, were



especially influential in the originating of a particular recommendation.

From an educational point of view, most, if not all, of the recommendations could be considered to have originated from a belief that educational practices or provisions were inadequate or inappropriate. Even those who saw much good with the present school system acknowledged room for improvement. (Mowat, interview, 1970) Thus, the most obvious origin of a recommendation can be assumed to have been a desire to improve the educational system.

When the recommendations dealt with in this study are considered in terms of substantive areas rather than as isolated recommendations, various forces emerge which appear to have exerted considerable influence as origins for these substantive areas. Origins for the recommendations dealt with in this study can be identified, to a large degree, from the forces or conditions detailed in Chapter 1.

The following sections of this chapter provide information on the possible origins of the various recommendations when grouped substantively according to the chapters of the Commission Report and, further, according to the sub-grouping used within chapters. (see Appendix E)

#### Administrative Personnel

Many of the recommendations pertaining to administrative personnel appear to have originated from a desire to maintain local control over educational policies. The rapidly changing population patterns had led to the redefining of the roles of the principal and the



superintendent and had created a demand for specialists in numerous subject areas. (Commission Report, 1959: 203-208) Several of the problems arising from this redefinition of roles were pointed out by the Alberta School Trustees' Association in its brief to the Cameron Commission:

With respect to our superintendents, particularly in the divisions and counties, it is becoming generally felt that too much of the superintendents' time is taken up with matters of detailed administration and business of the divisions and counties. Surely and gradually the superintendent is finding less time available for inspection of work being carried on in the classroom, and for consultation with principals and teaching staffs.

This is a field which should receive study and attention. We might ask and investigate such questions as:

1. Should assistant superintendents be provided in divisions and counties exceeding a certain number of classrooms?
2. Is the manner in which our superintendents are appointed satisfactory and is it proper that anyone should be expected to step directly from a principalship to a superintendency without the opportunity of some transition course and study of a more extensive nature than is now available?
3. Is it right and proper that many appointees to the superintendency should have to take considerably less salary than they received as a principal, and might not this situation be detrimental to the attraction of the right kind of people to the superintendency? (A.S.T.A. Brief, 1958: 3-4)

The Alberta Teachers' Association brief to the Cameron Commission emphasized the desirability of decentralization of authority at the superintendency level--especially with respect to rural areas:

He (the provincially appointed superintendent) remains a government-approved adviser to an elected school board to which he is not directly responsible. As a civil-servant, his civil and educational freedom is restricted by the policies of the Department which he services. (A.T.A. Brief, 1958: 68)

The recommendations pertaining to guidance originated from a wide area of concern. Approximately one-third of the briefs presented to the Commission made recommendations on guidance. (Commission Report, 1959: 209) Several forces can be identified as having been particularly



significant as origins for these recommendations.

The need for guidance services for Alberta schools was amplified by the increasing urbanization and centralization. (A.T.A. Brief, 1958: 93) The provision of guidance services for rural areas was noted by the Commission: "Rural parents realize the need for guidance services, their needs being perhaps even more acute with the changing rural pattern." (Commission Report, 1959: 210)

The emphasis on this need for rural areas was precipitated by the expanding economic base described in Chapter 2. As Uhlman (1961) pointed out, the educational needs of rural and urban children were not significantly different. Because the majority of rural-educated children would be absorbed into the urban labour force, the education they received must be designed to facilitate this absorption.

Dissatisfaction with the guidance services was not limited to rural areas. A general dissatisfaction was expressed by a group of employers canvassed by the Medicine Hat Chamber of Commerce. It was found that ". . . 66% of the employers consider that our schools fail to provide sufficient assistance to students in choosing a career." (Brief of Medicine Hat Chamber of Commerce, 1958: 3)

#### Facilities and Equipment

Those recommendations pertaining to school buses, residences, and the acquisition of funds through government grants appear to have originated from concerns initiated by the changing population patterns--the forces associated with this origin are educational, social, and economic in nature.



The educational concern for rural students led to the formation of large centralizations and, consequently, to the need for pupil conveyance and residences. Although concern over pupil conveyance practices originated to some degree from educational considerations (Dunlop et al., 1957), a greater impact was exerted by social forces in originating concern in this area. Numerous aspects of the centralization process--including the need for pupil conveyance and residences--were viewed by rural parents as having had an unfavourable effect on the home life. The parents disapproved of the absence of their children from the home to attend school in the larger centers or, in cases where pupil conveyance was employed, they objected to the extended periods of absence during the day. (Brief of Alberta Federation of Agriculture, Transcript of Hearing, 1958: 6)

Economic considerations relating to government grants originated from the need for a scheme of educational financing more advantageous to rural areas. The problem was summed up by Uhlman:

The indications are that--while local participation in the financing of education will continue--the almost universal significance of education, as born out by the trends heretofore discussed, means that the state must shoulder greater financial responsibility. One of the "shocking" financial implications of this survey is that we may have reconstructed an educational system which is inadequate to the needs, and, furthermore, is not entirely susceptible to the modifications that may be required.

A realistic approach to the problems of rural education must be based upon state responsibility sufficient to provide a financial guarantee of a sound basic education for all. Financial schemes of the future must distribute the costs of education, even more fully than now, beyond any locale. (Uhlman, 1961: 106)

The majority of those recommendations pertaining to the provision of improved library facilities appear to have originated from educational considerations of the increasingly important role of libraries in the



education of the students at all levels. The Alberta Library Association (Brief, 1958: 2) outlined the role of the school library in providing for the special needs of gifted students and in facilitating the multi-source approach to curricula. The Association also pointed out the essential need for the involvement of the Department of Education in the providing of specialist and co-ordinating services.

(Transcript of Hearing, 1958: 2-3)

Those recommendations pertaining to audio-visual aids were derived from numerous origins but two forces appeared to have been most influential in this area--the influence of the United States on Alber-  
tan educational practices and an over emphasis on technological aids to teaching.

Recommendations from the brief of the Edmonton Educational study Group illustrated the influence of both of these forces, "The Study Group proposes that the marvels of the electronic revolution be harnessed to help meet the . . . educational needs--in particular, television." (Brief, 1958: 2)

The Brief (1958: 2-3) described a number of studies or projects involving the use of television that had been initiated. Included in this number were fourteen references to American projects, two tests being conducted by the Canadian National Council on School Broadcasting, and a two week test conducted in Edmonton. Such an emphasis was hardly unexpected considering the technological advancement of the United States.

#### Other Matters of Organization

Those recommendations pertaining to staff load appear to have



originated from the progressivist-traditionalist controversy described in Chapter 2. The desire expressed in these recommendations not to reduce the amount of time available for instruction reflected the general desire of the anti-progressivist element to increase educational standards in the schools.

Those recommendations pertaining to Hutterites and Indians could be considered to have originated from the entire spectrum of social, economic, political, and educational forces. Because of the complex nature of the forces initiating these recommendations, the origins are most meaningfully considered together with the action taken towards implementing these recommendations. For this reason, the discussion of these origins is included in Chapter 6 along with a consideration of the degree of implementation.

#### DISCUSSION

The analysis of the sources and origins of the recommendations pertaining to organization and administration revealed several trends.

A significant result of the analysis of the sources was the indication of the considerable influence that the views expressed by educators had on the Commission members. A possible reason for this impact was advanced earlier in this chapter. (Mowat, interview, 1970) This finding assumes added significance when considered together with the public apathy towards many objectives held by the schools as indicated in Chapter 2. Similarly, the statement by the Alberta Teachers' Association in its Brief to the Alberta Royal Commission on Education (1958: 13) that, "No aspect of education can be properly considered



54

apart from the society it serves." finds little support in the conclusions of Black et al (1960: 35) that ". . . the average citizen is not inordinately interested in the public educational system . . . ." The above findings indicate that, in the era preceding the ordering of the Cameron Commission, concern for education in Alberta was largely limited to educators. Further, of the concern which emerged in response to the ordering of the Commission, the clearer understanding of the important educational issues demonstrated and articulated by educators furthered their relative impact on the school system through the considerable influence they exerted on the Commission and its conclusions.

As the discussion of the origins for the three substantive areas indicated, the force which appeared to have exerted considerable influence as a possible origin of the recommendations in each substantive area was the impact of the changing demands of a rapidly expanding economic base. Concomitant with this expansion was the urbanization of population which further amplified the changing educational needs--especially for the rural areas.

#### SUMMARY

This chapter identified the origins and sources of those recommendations pertaining to organization and administration.

The sources of the recommendations were defined, for the purposes of this study, to be the formal submissions made by various groups, organizations, or individuals.

The origins of recommendations were defined to be the social, economic, political, and educational forces and conditions that were



prominent in Alberta in the era preceding the ordering of the Cameron Commission. This chapter analyzed the origins of recommendations in terms of those forces or conditions which were most influential in precipitating concern for the substantive areas defined by the particular recommendations.



## Chapter 4

### ADMINISTRATIVE PERSONNEL

With respect to those recommendations pertaining to administrative personnel, this chapter provides information on the last two general questions and their sub-questions posed in the conceptual framework of the study. The immediate official reactions of various groups to these recommendations is detailed and the action taken by the groups is described in terms of the degree of implementation of those recommendations within their power to act on.

### THE REACTIONS

Several groups responded with an official reaction to the Commission.

The first group, the Alberta School Trustees' Association, held a special executive meeting on July 8, 1960 for the purpose of determining which of the recommendations would be considered to be the responsibility of school boards and, once these were determined, what the official A.S.T.A. position would be on each one. Dr. Mowat was present at the meeting to answer questions and clarify any possible ambiguity concerning the meaning of the recommendations.

A second group was the Department of Education. A committee consisting of senior officials of the Department was established (Clarke,



1968: 10) to study the Commission Report with these questions in mind:

1. What does the recommendation mean?
2. Is it a good thing?
3. What are the ramifications?
4. Who is responsible for implementation?
5. What are the administrative effects?

The committee may have been ordered in response to the intense criticism of the Commission Report as detailed in Chapter 2 of this study. The Edmonton Journal, in an editorial entitled, "Up to Edmonton's Backroom Boys" reacted to the ordering of the Committee:

The department of education is setting up a committee to look into the report of the Cameron Commission, a commission which was set up to look into the operation of the education department. What a wonderful world we live in! (Clarke, 1968: 10)

The report of the committee is filed at Central Files of the Department of Education, Edmonton.

The ordering of this committee constituted an official reaction of the Department of Education. However, the recommendations of this committee to the Department were not necessarily implemented. The significance of the committee's recommendations was that they were made to the Department of Education by senior officials of that Department. Official Department positions can only be determined through official statements, legislation, or regulations.

On March 17, 1961, Sessional Paper #68/61 was presented by the Department of Education which summarized the official position of the Department on the recommendations of the Cameron Commission. This summary was included along with the summary of the special committee to provide a comparison between the stated positions of both groups.



Two other groups which indicated official reaction were the Alberta Teachers' Association and the Faculty of Education, University of Alberta. Their reactions were derived from a publication of the A.T.A. (1961).

The reactions of the Alberta School Trustee's Association, the special Department of Education Committee, the Department of Education, and the Faculty of Education to those recommendations contained in this chapter are summarized in the following tables. The A.T.A. did not state an official position on the recommendations pertaining to administrative personnel at that time.

The comments derived from Sessional Paper #68/61 and the Special Committee Report often pertain to a group of recommendations rather than to single ones. In such cases, the recommendations are grouped and the comment stated.

Those recommendations for which no reaction appears were not seen by the various groups as within their power to implement at that time.

It is important to emphasize that the reactions summarized in the tables were the reactions in 1960 and 1961. Conditions have changed and personnel has changed; it is not unusual, therefore, to expect official positions to change. These changes were determined, where occurring, through interviews and examination of official documents and are considered under a following section dealing with the degree of implementation.



Table 5. Official Reaction of the Alberta School Trustees' Association to Those Recommendations Pertaining to Administrative Personnel Considered to be the Responsibility of Boards, 1960

Number	A.S.T.A. Reaction
184	Approved
189	Approved
190	Approved
191	Approved
193	Generally Acceptable



Table 6. Reaction of the Special Committee of the Department of Education to those Recommendations Pertaining to Administrative Personnel, 1960

Number	Reaction of Special Committee
175	Local appointment of superintendents is inevitable but the number of divisions fully competent to operate in this fashion is limited
180	Concur
181	
182	
183	Agree. Same grants to Divisions as to Districts
184	Agree. Joint responsibility of trustees, teachers,
185	Faculty, and Department
186	Steps have already been taken to implement this
187	
188	Department should ask the Superintendents of the Prov-
189	ince (local and Provincial) to devote their energies to
190	implementing these
191	
192	Department's role is seen as:
	1. Providing for study at provincial level
	2. Stimulating participation at local level
193	Department should stimulate further training by teachers with appropriate experience
194	Role of the Department is not in providing direct funds
195	Referred to Board of Teacher Education
196	Questions practicability and advisability of placing all guidance courses at graduate level. Referred to Board of Teacher Education



Table 7. Official Reaction of the Department of Education to those Recommendations Pertaining to Administrative Personnel; Sessional Paper #68/61, 1961

Number	Official Reaction of Department
175	As a matter of policy the Government believes that School Superintendents in the rural areas and the smaller urban centres of the Province should be employed by the Department of Education. This system which has been followed ever since the Province was established has provided excellent liaison between the local and provincial levels of school administration and will bring the best possible results in the future.
177	Recent regulations adopted by the Department of Education implement this
180	High School Inspectors are now stationed at Lethbridge, Calgary, Red Deer, Grande Prairie and Edmonton. Because these recommendations are linked with the five preceding recommendations which advocate a transition from provincially employed Superintendents to locally employed Superintendents, which is not favored by the Government, no action will be taken to establish the system proposed.
184	The Department concurs with the desirability of having a statement of duties and a statement of minimum qualifications, but believes that such statements should be developed jointly by trustees, teachers, the Faculty of Education and the Department of Education.
186	Steps have already been taken to render greater assistance to school boards in these regards.
188	School Superintendents of the Province are making a study of these recommendations with a view to developing and implementing plans for improvement
189	
190	
191	
192	The Guidance Branch of the Department of Education and the Board of Teacher Education and Certification will consider ways and means of dealing with these recommendations
193	
194	
195	
196	



Table 8. Reaction of the Faculty of Education to those Recommendations Pertaining to Administrative Personnel.

Number	Reaction of Faculty of Education
180	Through expansion of its graduate programs the Faculty of Education has provided increased opportunities for students to specialize in a variety of fields and to prepare for service as consultants or supervisors.
190	The Faculty of Education has in recent years increased and intensified its facilities for graduate work in the specialized areas of guidance and counselling. Plans for the new Education Building include up-to-date physical facilities for the preparation of specialists in the guidance and counselling of school children. There will be facilities for graduate students to work with children individually or in small groups under the supervision of faculty staff.
195	The Provincial Guidance Committee, which includes in its membership representatives from the staff of the Faculty of Education, has drawn up proposed new requirements for the junior and senior certificates in guidance at the graduate level.



Table 5 indicates that the Alberta School Trustees' Association viewed a limited number of those recommendations pertaining to administrative personnel as being the responsibility of school boards. With the exception of recommendation 184, which advocated the establishment of qualifications for the principalship, the only recommendations seen as the responsibility of school boards were recommendations 189, 190, 191, and 193 which dealt with the desirability of employing suitable personnel for guidance services. Agreement was expressed for all the recommendations reacted to.

A comparison of Table 6 and Table 7 indicates that, with the exception of recommendations 180, 181, and 182 which advocate the establishment of specialized services on a regional basis, the reactions of the Special Committee and the Department of Education concur. While the Special Committee agreed with recommendations 180, 181, and 182, the Department did not agree with them since their implementation was linked with the implementation of preceding recommendations advocating a transition from provincially employed to locally employed superintendents. Both groups expressed disagreement with the adoption of those recommendations, numbers 175 to 179 inclusive, at that time.

Table 8 indicates that the Faculty of Education reacted to those recommendations pertaining to the preparation and qualifications of administrative personnel. The Faculty reactions to recommendations 180, 182, 190, 192, and 195 indicated the provisions made at the university level for preparation and certification in the areas of specialized consultants and supervisors and guidance.



## THE ACTIONS

For the purpose of determining the degree of implementation of the recommendations of the Commission Report, a number of recommendations were grouped together. This procedure was used in cases involving recommendations dealing with closely related topics or recommendations whose implementation follows or depends on the implementation of a preceding recommendation.

Each recommendation is stated in the following text and the action taken is detailed. In cases where groups of recommendations are considered, each recommendation of the group is stated before the action taken is described. The recommendations are primarily grouped under the substantive subject areas as they appear within the chapters of the Commission Report. However, in a number of cases, recommendations which lend themselves to consideration as a group did not appear as consecutively numbered recommendations in the Commission Report. In such cases, the recommendations are not considered in order within substantive groupings in this study but are considered in the order judged to be the most advantageous for the purposes of detailing the action taken.

### Superintendents and Special Services

Recommendation 175. That legal provisions be made whereby divisions and counties may appoint their own superintendent in lieu of a provincially-employed superintendent.

Recommendation 176. That the province specify in law such functions of the locally-appointed superintendents as will safeguard immediate provincial interests in education.

Recommendation 178. That direct and indirect benefits now common to the superintendents' and teachers' groups in Alberta be suitably preserved (pension, tenure, etc.).



Recommendation 179. That an avowed transition plan be devised to effect the transfer from provincially-appointed superintendents to locally-employed superintendents in divisions and counties.

Recommendation 183. That the Department of Education pay grants to local authorities who employ superintendents, according to a true equalization principle, or failing this, in amounts which would be equal to the salary paid the superintendent if he were provincially employed.

As indicated previously, the Department's reaction to these recommendations in 1961 was one of non-approval; however, recommendations 175 and 178 have since been implemented. The School Act was amended in 1968 to allow Counties and Divisions to appoint their own superintendents. Two Divisions, Northland #61 and Drumheller Valley #62, and two Counties, Stettler #6 and Lacombe #14, have locally appointed superintendents. The 1970 revision to The School Act directs that a board "shall" appoint a superintendent of schools. (Sec. 64)

L. G. Hall, Director of School Administration, indicated several of the arguments against implementation of recommendation 175:

There are people who felt it was well for the government to have some representative on the scene of action. He was there as a representative of the government. He was considered to be an impartial observer of procedures and so on. The public looked upon him as apart from subject to the will of the board. He was there to advise the board. He was not an employee of the board, hence he was not the voice of the board.

Secondly, he was paid by the Department and not the board.

Thirdly, the superintendent, as a provincial appointee, has closer liaison with the government in matters of curriculum, and changing policy. As an instructional leader in the area, he has to be more closely allied with changing curriculum trends. (Hall, interview, 1970)

As to the reasons for the change in the Department's position, Rees (Interview, 1970) suggested that thought has matured a little further and that the personnel has changed a great deal.



Dr. Rees (Interview, 1970) indicated, regarding recommendation 179, which advocates the design of a plan to facilitate the transfer to locally employed superintendents, that such a plan exists but, as yet, is not official. For this reason, this recommendation was considered to have been implemented in part.

Recommendation 176 has not been implemented. The determination of the duties of locally appointed superintendents is felt to be a matter of local concern. The revised School Act (1970: Section 64-1) states that ". . . each appointment is subject to such terms and conditions as the board prescribes, either generally or affecting a particular appointment."

Recommendation 178, supporting the preservation of direct and indirect benefits for superintendents and teachers in Alberta, has been implemented.

Recommendation 183, which advocates a salary equalization principle for locally employed superintendents, has been implemented in part. The School Foundation Program comprises the equalization principle employed by the Department. A locally employed superintendent is considered as supportive staff as his salary is negotiable with the local board. The second part of this recommendation, suggesting that equality of salary be established, has not been implemented.

Recommendation 177. That qualifications with force of law be established to govern eligibility for appointments of all superintendents in Alberta.

This recommendation has been implemented. Regulations (August 15, 1968) pursuant to the provisions in the School Act for the appointment of locally employed superintendents establishes the necessary qualifications. (See Appendix F)



Recommendation 180. That the province enter the service field of supervision through the provision of highly qualified and specialized regional consultants.

Recommendation 181. That the development of a regional system of special services be coordinated with the plan of transfer away from provincially-appointed generalists, and include, as required, more training or retraining of present field personnel.

Recommendation 182. That the immediate nucleus of each regional office include high school inspectors, specialist personnel in reading, English language, guidance; and superintendents required to inspect rural and small urban schools which are independent of divisions and counties.

As indicated in Table 7, Department reaction was originally one of opposition to these recommendations. However, these recommendations have since been implemented in part. The nature of recommendations 180, 181, and 182 is such that the implementation of their intended practices is a continuous process. R. E. Rees indicated the scope of the plan:

We have designated six Regions in Alberta and will have probably forty-five provincially employed regional officers who are presently Superintendents of Schools. They will staff the Regional Offices as advisory, consultative and evaluation officers. On occasion there might be inspection and regulation involved, but basically there will be consultation. (Rees, interview, 1970)

The Department of Education Report for 1969 outlines the duties and efforts of these specialists and provides a map of Alberta showing the boundaries of the six zones. (1969: 56-60)

### Principals

Recommendation 184. That desirable qualifications be established with regard to the principalship in Alberta.

Recommendation 185. That job specifications as indicated in this report be included in The School Act to clarify and give status to the full scope of the principal's duties.

Recommendation 184 and 185 have not been implemented. The



qualifications of principals have never been legally established except that he or she hold a ". . . permanent or temporary certificate of qualification as a teacher issued by the Minister under The Department of Education Act." (The School Act, 1967)

The duties of the principal as outlined in the Commission Report (1959: 207) have never been given legal status. The 1970 revision of the School Act has omitted reference to even general duties of the principal and states only, in effect, that a board shall appoint a principal. (Section 80) Variations in local conditions and situations have limited the usefulness and meaningfulness of implementation of these recommendations.

Recommendation 186. That the Department of Education, with other parties concerned, intensify efforts to gauge the needs for professional assistant personnel in local school systems.

Recommendation 187. That as a service to local systems, the Department of Education sponsor continued study of the optimum assistant and special staff required to operate effectively schools of varying sizes.

Recommendations 186 and 187 have been implemented in part. Implementation is a continuous process. Essentially, the need for professional assistant personnel is determined by pupil enrolment and the classroom unit. (Rees, interview, 1970) Under the Grant structure, the classroom unit was established at 26 students. Elementary and Junior High schools receive allowances for seven supportive personnel per 1,000 students and high schools receive eight per 1,000. The procedure outlined above for determining the number of professional assistant personnel is reviewed as the need arises.



Guidance

Recommendation 188. That a thorough study of the extent, nature, and quality of the present guidance services in the province be made.

This recommendation is considered as still under review by the Department of Education.

The Report of the Department of Education for 1966 indicates that a study entitled, "An Analysis of Alberta School Counsellor Training and Placement" was being initiated by the Guidance Branch. Since that time, personnel has changed and the whereabouts of the report, if it was ever completed, are unknown. Knowledge of the results of the study is non-existent. L. Ferguson, Provincial Supervisor of Guidance for the Department of Education, emphasized the current need for just such a study to do an absolute count of those people involved in counselling and to know just what training they do have. This is the sort of information that should be available on an on-going basis. (Ferguson, interview, 1970)

Numerous research studies have been completed at the university level dealing with such topics as the perceived roles of counsellors or the training and placement of counsellors at specific levels within school systems or districts. The closest approximation to a provincial study is "A Study of the Career Decisions of Canadian Youth"--a survey carried out in 1966 by the Canadian Department of Labour in co-operation with the Departments of Education of the provinces of Canada. One section of the report deals with the training, experience and professional load of counsellors across Canada.

In general, the report presents an unfavourable picture of the guidance services in Canada. Because of sampling techniques, the fig-



ures quoted are only estimates of the total picture. Some of the statistics for Alberta are presented in Table 9 along with the corresponding Canadian averages.

Table 9. Responses of Counsellors, Teachers, and Principals to Selected Questions from "A Study of Career Decisions of Canadian Youth" (1967: 162-167)

	PERCENTAGE	ALBERTA	CANADA
TEACHERS AND COUNSELLORS			
Proportion of staff involved in guidance work	27.0	19.4	
More than 10 hours per week spent in guidance work	10.3	12.4	
At least 2 years experience in guidance	72.0	75.8	
Hold certificate, diploma, or degree in guidance	19.4	32.7	
PRINCIPALS			
Proportion of staff involved in guidance work	89.8	75.0	
More than 10 hours per week spent in guidance work	1.8	4.8	
At least 2 years experience in guidance	89.4	95.1	
Hold certificate, diploma, or degree in guidance	9.8	14.0	

The data in Table 9 indicate that a considerable number of Alberta's principals (89.8%) are involved in guidance or counselling. Concern that this practice persists in Alberta schools has been expressed repeatedly in the Department of Education Annual Reports. (1961: 25), (1962: 20), (1964: 19), (1968: 25)



Recommendation 189. That since specialized skills are required to perform the guidance function adequately, these services be withheld until suitable personnel are available.

This recommendation is still under consideration by the Department of Education and other bodies concerned with the acquisition of guidance services. At least two factors appear to be preventing implementation at this time. First, considerable ambiguity exists as to what are the "specialized skills required to perform the guidance function adequately" and, even, what the "guidance function" is. Consequently, criteria for "suitable personnel" are difficult to establish. Second, the reality of circumstances in many areas precipitates the attitude that some guidance is better than none.

Recommendation 190. That, at all levels, persons assigned to counselling services be rigidly selected as to personality, preparation and interest.

Recommendation 191. That as soon as qualified personnel are available, all school systems, rural and urban, initiate or extend guidance and counselling services to meet their needs.

Recommendation 193. That guidance and counselling personnel be selected from qualified teachers with appropriate experience.

Recommendations 191 and 193 are implemented to the extent that school systems, generally, attempt to provide the best guidance services they can afford. The reality of the situation, however, seriously limits the action that boards are able to take on these recommendations. The financial situation is discussed under a consideration of the action taken on recommendations 192. Implementation of recommendations 191 and 193 is a continuous process and these recommendations are, thus, implemented in part.

The determination of the degree of implementation of recommendation 190 depends on how "rigidly" guidance personnel are selected. The



Department of Education "suggests" that such people hold at least a Diploma or Master's Degree in Guidance or Counselling. (Ferguson, interview, 1970) In view of this "suggestion" and the shortage of personnel holding such certification, recommendation 190 is considered to be still under review.

Recommendation 192. That a plan be sponsored immediately by the Department of Education, trustees, teachers and the university, whereby the supply of qualified guidance personnel may be increased to meet present needs.

Recommendation 192 is rejected. It was implemented, on the part of the Department of Education at least, but the action has been reversed as of January 1, 1970. In 1966 provision was made in the School Foundation Grant for a guidance incentive of \$1500 to be paid to boards that employed a counsellor three-quarters time or more. Because there were no criteria established as to the qualifications of the personnel designated by the boards as counsellors, there was some suggestion that this money was not being used to procure the best possible guidance services. This may have been one of the reasons for the cancellation of the incentive grant. (Ferguson, interview, 1970) Guidance personnel are now considered as professional supportive staff under the new grant structure and, as such, the decision as to whether or not to employ guidance personnel will have to be made by local boards. Mr. T. Wiedenhammer, Provincial Secretary of the Alberta School Trustees' Association recently pointed out (Interview, 1970) that the new School Act and grant structure will place considerably more responsibility on local boards for the provision of special service and support personnel--more thought will have to be given to many decisions at all levels.

The removal of the incentive grant is seen by some as posing a



threat to the quality of the guidance services. A. Herman, Associate Professor of Educational Psychology at the University of Calgary and President of the Guidance Council of the Alberta Teachers' Association commented on the effects of the removal of the grant:

... it will have a deleterious effect especially in rural areas. Counseling has not as yet had time to prove itself. Moreover, many of our practicing counselors lack training to know what the whole thing is about and consequently have not "sold" counseling. When boards are given X number of dollars with no stated allotment for those dollars they will first cut supportive services if cuts need to be made. In recent conversation with two rural districts I was told that a reduction of 22 of 217 people were required in one area and 14 of 204 in the other area to comply with the present formula espoused by the Minister. Counselors will probably be regarded as expendable. (Correspondence, 1970)

Recommendation 194. That financial assistance be available for selected teachers wishing to enrol in special courses for the purpose of engaging in various phases of guidance and counselling work.

This recommendation has been implemented in full. Considerable impetus was provided in 1963 by the availability of Federal funds designed to increase the number of personnel in the vocational guidance area. These funds, together with a lesser amount of provincial and local board financing, enabled practicing teachers to obtain a diploma in guidance. The program was first established at the University of Alberta in 1963 and a similar program was established at the University of Calgary in 1967. (Ferguson, interview, 1970)

Recommendation 195. That the requirements for a Junior Certificate in Guidance be reviewed and revised.

Recommendation 196. That courses towards both the Junior and Senior Certificate be offered as a special program and at the graduate level only.

Both these recommendations can be considered as having been rejected as their intent is no longer relevant. In a telephone conversation (May 8, 1970) with Mr. J. Sheppy, Registrar, Department of Edu-



cation, it was indicated that as of September 1, 1961, the Board of Teacher Education and Certification no longer issued special certificates of any kind. It was felt that the function of certification at the government level was simply to grant permission to teach. Also, it was decided that the school systems and their superintendents should be mature enough to evaluate the qualifications of their personnel on their own.

#### DISCUSSION

Table 10 is a summary of the degree of implementation of the recommendations pertaining to administrative personnel. Each recommendation is classified in terms of one of the levels of "Action" of the conceptual framework described in Chapter 1.

Several trends are evident from the analysis of the reactions and actions.

All the recommendations which are classified in Table 10 as having been rejected were found to be irrelevant in terms of the social, economic, political, and educational forces existing in Alberta today. Recommendations 176, 184, and 185, pertaining to job specifications and qualifications for principals and functions of locally employed superintendents, are irrelevant in view of the considerable variations in local conditions and the increased responsibility assumed by local administrators--lay and professional. Similarly, recommendations 195 and 196, dealing with qualifications of guidance personnel, are irrelevant due to the increased maturity of local officials in evaluating their staff and the increased responsibility in assessing their needs.



Table 10. The Degree of Implementation of Those Recommendations Pertaining to Administrative Personnel

Implemented in Part	Implemented in Full	Still Under Consideration	Rejected
179	175	188	176
180	177	189	184
181	178	190	185
182	194		192
183			195
186			196
187			
191			
193			



Recommendations that were vague as to their intent or which did not indicate a group or a method intended for the implementation, were often delayed in being implemented or were not acted on at all. What, for example, would constitute the "rigid" selection of guidance personnel suggested in recommendation 190? Similarly, numerous recommendations refer to "qualified" personnel but no mention is made as to the requirements which should be met before guidance personnel are considered qualified.

This lack of specificity initiates a particular problem in the classification of some recommendations as having been implemented in full. A number of recommendations provide no measure to determine full implementation even though Department of Education sources classify them as fully implemented. Recommendations 186 and 187, which are classified as implemented in part and pertain to gauging the need for professional assistants, provide examples of this lack of a measure of full implementation. When are efforts to gauge such needs fully implemented? Implementation of these two recommendations, as well as of recommendations 180, 181, 182, and 193, is a continuous process.

At least one recommendation, number 189, which suggests that guidance services be withheld until suitable personnel are available, was prevented from being implemented by the impracticality of its intent. Not only did this recommendation fail to take into account the reality of the state of the existing guidance services but its implementation was further prevented by the necessity of prior action on those recommendations pertaining to incentives and training facilities for guidance personnel. Thus, if these recommendations were not implemented and recommendation 189 was, the guidance services in the prov-



ince, inadequate as they were, would have essentially disappeared.

The similarity illustrated in Tables 6 and 7 between the reactions of the Special Committee and the Department of Education implies a considerable influence exerted by the civil service on the degree of implementation of numerous recommendations. There is some suggestion that the degree of implementation of certain recommendations depends, to a considerable degree, on the reaction of the professional educators in the Department of Education. (Byrne, interview, 1970)

#### SUMMARY

This chapter provided information on the questions posed under the levels "Reaction" and "Action" of the conceptual framework of the study described in Chapter 1 for those recommendations pertaining to Administrative Personnel.

The "Reactions" of the various groups were taken from their official statements pertaining to the recommendation of the Cameron Commission.

For the purposes of this study, the "Actions" are interpreted as present degrees of implementation of the recommendations as defined in Chapter 1. Table 10 provides a summary of the degree of implementation of those recommendations pertaining to Administrative Personnel. Possible explanations for the present degree of implementation of the recommendations are discussed and a number of significant trends suggested by the analysis of the "Reactions" and "Actions" is indicated.



## Chapter 5

### FACILITIES AND EQUIPMENT

The last two general questions posed in the conceptual framework of this study relate to the reactions of various groups to the recommendations of the Cameron Commission and to the actions initiated by these groups towards implementing those recommendations within their power to act on. This chapter provides information on these questions and their specific sub-questions as they relate to those recommendations pertaining to facilities and equipment.

#### THE REACTIONS

The reaction of the A.S.T.A. can be summarized very briefly. Only three recommendations pertaining to facilities and equipment were seen as the responsibility of school boards: number 238, suggesting the accessibility of the school library to the general community; number 240, emphasizing audio-visual inservice education for teachers; number 242, encouraging local boards to build up their own audio-visual libraries. The A.S.T.A. approved all three recommendations.

The reactions of the Special Committee of the Department of Education, the Department of Education, the A.T.A., and the Faculty of Education are summarized in Tables 11, 12, 13 and 14 respectively.



Table 11. Reaction of the Special Committee of the Department of Education to those Recommendations pertaining to Facilities and Equipment, 1960

Number	Reaction of Special Committee
221	Agree if does not mean reduced grants for classroom space
225	Agree that one good residential school for the province is necessary but more would require study
227	Agree but the development of such a plan should await the necessity
237	Refer to Cultural Activities Branch and library supervisor when appointed
238	This is a matter of local concern due to varying circumstances
224	
226	
235	
239	
240	
241	
242	Agree
243	
244	
245	
248	
249	
236	Not agree
247	Refer to Faculty
250	Not necessary. Desirable results can be achieved by direct negotiation with publisher at no cost to Department
251	Not necessary except for special cases than can be dealt with on an ad hoc basis



Table 12. Official Reaction of the Department of Education to those Recommendations Pertaining to Facilities and Equipment; Sessional Paper #68/61, 1961

Number	Official Reaction of Department
221	The Government does not concur with these recommendations
226	
222	Because the School Buildings Assistance Board and the School Buildings Branch of the Department of Education as well as the Architects Branch of the Department of Public Works presently fulfill all of the proposed functions, there would appear to be no need to establish such an Advisory Committee.
223	
224	The Department of Education accepts the desirability of providing some general guides to school bus service and will carefully review this recommendation in the light of the report which will very shortly be submitted by the School Bus Enquiry Committee appointed on November 30, 1960
225	No action has been taken with respect to these recommendations
227	
228	Such lists are published each year by the School Book Branch of the Department of Education
229	
230	
231	These recommendations will be reviewed from time to time and action will be taken with respect to the various features proposed as facilities and funds permit.
232	
233	
234	
235	
236	Because library service is closely related to Adult Education, the proposition that all library service within the Province be effected through the Department of Education is not acceptable. It is recognized, however, that it is desirable to encourage closer liaison between the School Library and the Community Library and this is being accomplished by the Government's Regional Library Program.
238	



Table 12. (continued)

Number	Official Reaction of Department
237	This recommendation is being referred to the Cultural Activities Branch of the Provincial Secretary's Department for study and consideration
239	The Department is taking action towards implementing these recommendations
240	
241	
242	Some action has already been taken by local school authorities to establish and build up their own film libraries, and the Department will continue to encourage this practice
244	In cooperation with local television stations and the C.B.C., the Faculty of Education and the school boards of the larger urban districts of the Province, several experimental television programs for schools have been carried out. This work will be continued
245	
246	
247	
248	In an effort to explore the advisability of initiating the action recommended in No. 248 the matter will be referred for discussion to a meeting of Ministers of Education to be held at the time of the 1961 Convention of the Canadian Education Association
249	
250	This is not considered necessary. Desirable results can be achieved by direct negotiation with the publisher at no cost to the Department of Education
251	



Table 13. Reaction of the A.T.A. to those Recommendations Pertaining to Facilities and Equipment

Number	Reaction of A.T.A.
231	Approve in principle
228	
229	
230	Still under consideration
232	

Table 14. Reaction of the Faculty of Education to those Recommendations Pertaining to Facilities and Equipment

Number	Reaction of Faculty of Education
241	The Faculty of Education intends to add to its staff in 1961 an audio-visual specialist.
247	In the planning of the new Education Building on the Edmonton campus efforts are being made to make the building fully modern with respect to audio-visual and communicative devices. All classrooms will be served with facilities for closed circuit television and will permit projection of slides and films. There will be in the new building a studio for production of television programs and a large audio-visual centre designed to train teachers in the effective use of audio-visual aids.



A comparison of Tables 11 and 12 suggests a high degree of similarity between the reactions of the Special Committee appointed by the Department of Education and the official reactions of the Department as presented in Sessional Paper #68/61. Few notable differences exist between the reactions of the two groups.

Table 13 indicates that the Alberta School Trustees' Association agreed in principle with recommendation 231, suggesting the establishment of criteria to gauge the need for school librarians. Recommendations 228 and 229, pertaining to book quotas and a basic list of library books, and recommendations 230 and 232, concerning a system of grants for library personnel and facilities, were all classified as still under consideration. No other recommendations pertaining to facilities and equipment were considered to be the responsibility of school boards.

Table 14 indicates the steps intended by the Faculty of Education as a reaction to recommendations 241 and 247, pertaining to the inservice and pre-service training of teachers in the use of audio-visual aids. The reactions indicate the planned additions of personnel and facilities necessary for the implementation of these recommendations.

#### THE ACTIONS

The same practice of grouping recommendations for the purpose of describing the degree of implementation is used in this chapter as was employed in Chapter 4. Recommendations are primarily grouped according to substantive areas and grouping within these areas is used



in cases where recommendations are interrelated in terms of implementation.

### Facilities and Equipment

Recommendation 221. That some means be devised whereby essential non-instructional facilities be recognized for purposes of grants.

This recommendation is still under consideration. The main difficulty in determining the degree of implementation of this recommendation is the interpretation of "essential." When considering things which are non-instructional, there is a fine line between what is essential and what is supportive. (Hall, interview, 1970) This source of ambiguity has apparently deterred implementation of this recommendation.

Recommendation 222. That the province establish a School Buildings Advisory Committee, to include architects, engineers and other suitable specialists, for the purpose of planning an evaluation of school buildings.

Recommendation 223. That the terminal objective of such a plan be to publish information to guide school boards.

Recommendation 222 has been implemented in full. Dr. L. Hall, Director of School Administration, is the chairman of the School Buildings Advisory Committee. The committee includes architects, engineers, representatives of the A.T.A., A.S.T.A., and urban superintendents.

Recommendation 223 has been implemented in part. The committee actually serves as an advisory committee to the Minister of Education. Their concern is mainly with regulations and many of their recommendations are adopted by the School Buildings Branch and appear in handbooks. In this way, published information is provided to school boards. Further, as was previously indicated, the A.S.T.A. has direct influence on the recommendations of the advisory committee through its membership



on the Committee. (Hall, interview, 1970)

### School Buses

Recommendation 224. That norms be established for the travel time of students on school buses, and that school boards be urged to heed these norms through more careful consideration of equipment needed to perform service within designated time limits.

The majority of public concern over transportation facilities in the late 1950's was centered around the safety of school children during conveyance to and from classes. Chalmers (1958: 18) indicates the public demands for improved roads and shorter bus routes to provide faster service, gate pick-up of all children, and the conveyance of high school students to larger high schools due to the shortage of high school teachers and the inadequacies of the small high schools.

A report from the Alberta Advisory Committee on Educational Research (Dunlop et al., 1957) emphasized the effect of time spent in school buses on the achievement of elementary pupils. The results of the study expressed concern for the apparent inability of the students in the lower grades to cope with excessive travelling time.

The Alberta School Trustees' Association in its Brief to the Royal Commission (1958: 15) referred to this study as support for its concern over transportation facilities in rural areas.

Concern over the safety of the pupils continued to dominate examinations of transportation facilities in the 1960's. A collision between a train and a school bus in 1961 in which sixteen students were killed prompted the government to order a committee to investigate school bus operations in Alberta. (Lawrence, 1961) The emphasis in the report was on safety and no mention was made of travel time norms.



The Alberta School Trustees' Association conducted an extensive School Bus Survey in 1965 but, again, no mention was made of travel time norms.

Improved roads and transportation services and facilities and the improvement of rural educational facilities seem to have contributed to a lesser visible concern over travel time norms.

While persons concerned with pupil conveyance have attempted to reduce the travel time for students, no attempt has been made to establish norms. The diversity of local conditions would seem to have complicated the implementation of this recommendation. Recommendation 224 is still under consideration.

### Residences

Recommendation 225. That the Department afford special study to the place of pupil residences in the public school system.

Recommendation 226. That grants and services re school buildings be extended to include school residences.

Recommendation 227. That a plan be developed and held in readiness whereby the Department will sponsor the training of selected personnel to operate school residences.

Recommendation 225 has been implemented. (Hall, interview, 1970) The general conclusion of the study was that the public was not favourable towards the establishment of dormitories. The improvement of roads and transportation facilities and the increase in the number of educational centers have considerably reduced the need for residences.

Recommendation 226 has been implemented in part. It is possible to obtain some financial assistance through the School Grants on the interest on debentures provided the debenture is determined to be eligible



for such assistance by the School Buildings Board.

Further provision for students is available through government grants towards room and board in cases where a student from a Division or County must attend classes away from home in order to obtain the appropriate courses. If a student must leave a District, the board often pays his room and board and is reimbursed by the government for up to 90% of these expenses. The provision and the reimbursement vary from district to district.

Recommendation 227 is still under consideration. The government has not rejected this recommendation but the unlikelihood of ever having to implement it has kept it from being implemented even in part.

### Libraries

Recommendation 228. That a basic list of library books be devised to include all types desirable in a school.

This recommendation is rejected. Such a list was provided at one time but the amount of material available grew considerably and the quality of the people in the libraries increased to the point where they developed their own resources. The list published by the School Book Branch of the Department of Education became limiting in this sense. The present policy is to publish, through the services of the Provincial Libraries Consultant, lists of selection material indicating costs, sources, and a brief annotation.

Recommendation 229. That minimal and compulsory book quotas be established for schools of various enrolments.

This recommendation has been implemented in part. In 1967, the Canadian School Libraries Association conducted a "Study of Library



Services for Canadian Schools". The report suggests the following quantitative standards for school libraries:

Basic book collection

The basic collection should be provided in one to three years from capital grants.

Elementary school, Grades 1 to 6: 5000 titles

Secondary school, Grades 7 to 13: 5000 titles

Continuation school, Grades 1 to 13: 7500 titles

Growth of the book collection after the basic collection has been placed in a school

The collection is developed from annual expenditure.

In schools with a student population of 300 or less the collection should be expanded to 30 books per pupil or to the basic collection, whichever is greater.

In schools having more than 300 pupils the library should continue to expand until it has 20 or more volumes per student.

(Report, 1967: 52)

These standards are recommended by the Department as guide lines for school libraries.

Recommendation 230. That the system of school grants be modified to provide incentive for the establishment and development of school libraries and the employment of professional librarians.

Recommendation 232. That both library renewal and maintenance grants be provided by the province.

Recommendation 230 has been implemented in part. That section of recommendation 230 referring to incentive for the employment of librarians was implemented at one time but has since been rejected. In 1965 the government provided an incentive grant of \$1500 over and above the salary grant to school boards for any teacher, regardless of qualifications, employed two-thirds time or more as a librarian. In 1966, one hundred thirty-six teachers were eligible for this grant and in 1969 four hundred forty-seven were eligible. Effective January 1, 1970,



the incentive grant was removed and librarians are considered as professional supportive staff for the purposes of the Grant Structure.

Library expenditures per pupil depends on the individual school. Since library expenditures are part of the instructional grants, the total spent on libraries often depends on the individual school or principal.

Recommendation 232 has been implemented in full. As of January, 1968, grants of \$200 per square foot, to a maximum of \$8000, is provided for new libraries and \$500 per school is provided for renovation of existing facilities to provide libraries.

Recommendation 231. That criteria be established to indicate need for libraries in schools or in school systems.

This recommendation has been implemented in part. Again the suggestions offered by the Canadian School Libraries Association are used as guidelines by the Department of Education. Personnel requirements are outlined as follows:

Personnel requirements for school libraries by student enrolment

These requirements are based on library service in which the processing of library materials is handled commercially or by centralized services. Schools need additional clerical and professional assistance if processing is to be in the school.

	Fewer than 300 students	More than 300 students
Librarians	1 room school: librarian sent from Central Library Services 30 to 150 pupils; part-time, according to school population, and sent from Central Ser- vices 150 to 300 pupils: minimum of half-time librarian	1 librarian for first 300 students 1 librarian for each additional 500 students or major fraction thereof



Clerks 1 clerk for each 500 students  
or major fraction thereof  
(Report, 1961: 57)

Recommendation 233. That all teachers receive instruction in techniques of using the library in their teacher education program.

Recommendation 234. That the government investigate the advisability of asking the university to introduce library service courses for the training of teacher-librarians.

Recommendation 233 is still under consideration. Those concerned with library facilities recognize the value of this recommendation but factors of cost, time, space, and personnel prevent its implementation. (Reed, interview, 1970) In some cases, instruction may be given at the request of one of the professors but this occurs rarely and is not compulsory. (Snow, correspondence, 1970)

Recommendation 234 has been implemented in part. Library Science courses for the instruction of teacher-librarians are offered at the University of Alberta and the University of Calgary. There is, however, little evidence to suggest that the provincial government provided significant initial impetus towards the establishment of these programmes. Considerable impetus to the establishment of the School of Library Science at the University of Alberta came from a brief submitted jointly by the Library Associations of Alberta, Saskatchewan, and Manitoba (1964) to the presidents of the four western provincial universities outlining the need for a library school in the Prairie provinces. At that time, there were only three accredited library schools in Canada--McGill, Toronto, and British Columbia--and the loss of personnel to these areas was seriously limiting library services in the Prairie provinces!



Because of the distance from the existing schools, libraries on the Prairies have always experienced difficulty in attracting graduates when there are so many job opportunities nearby. Only by establishing a library school on the Prairies is there any hope of averting a major crisis in the supply of professional librarians in the region, and even then the crisis will be upon us before the first library school class can be graduated.

(Brief of Joint Library Associations, 1964: 1)

The School of Library Science was established at the University of Alberta in 1967 and its first graduating class of forty-three Bachelors of Library Science was graduated in 1969.

Recommendation 235. That the Department of Education provide specialist library supervision and advice for the public schools.

This recommendation has been implemented in full as of September, 1966, with the appointment of a School Libraries Consultant.

Recommendation 236. That coordination of all library services within the province be effected under the Department of Education.

This recommendation is under consideration. Some consideration has been given to including some of the services of the Cultural Development Branch under the Department of Education but no definite steps have yet been taken.

Recommendation 237. That a study be made of the values to be derived from a provincial library servicing centre.

This recommendation is rejected. The idea of a central serving center is obsolete because of the adequate services provided by commercial servicing centers and the provision of prepared cataloguing material with the purchase of books. (Friederichsen, interview, 1970)

Recommendation 238. That the possibilities of making the school library accessible and of service to the general community be explored.

This recommendation is implemented in part. Approximately forty schools have adult collections as part of their total collection. Some problems with this arrangement exist in cases where the public library



is in the school library--there is seldom space for these extra adult collections and, often, problems arise when students bring home the adult books. Also, adults often appear reluctant to visit libraries located in schools. (Friederichsen, interview, 1970)

### Audio-Visual Aids

Recommendation 239. That the Department of Education sponsor the development of a pool of persons competent in audio-visual aids to assist in the inservice education of teachers.

Recommendation 240. That emphasis upon audio-visual aids in the inservice education of teachers be increased.

Implementation of both of these recommendations is considered to be a continuous process. Each, therefore, is considered to have been implemented in part. The Audio Visual Services Branch of the Department of Education, under the supervision of L. T. Shorter, is comprised of a group of persons highly qualified to assist in the inservice education of teachers.

Recommendation 241. That as part of the preservice or undergraduate education of teachers, the Faculty of Education study the merits of offering an intense short course designed as an introduction to the proper use of audio-visual aids.

Recommendation 241 has been implemented in part. R. H. Bell, Director of the Instructional Media Services, University of Calgary, responded to this recommendation as follows:

Our approach has not been to offer a special short course for future teachers, but rather a full year's course in instructional technology and media. The emphasis in this course is not on the operation of audiovisual aids, but rather on the way in which instructional technology relates to the teaching-learning process. However, as a part of this course (Ed CI 362) all students are required to spend enough out of class time in the Media Laboratory to become proficient in the operation of all basic audiovisual equipment. They receive no grade for this activity, but they receive no grade for the course unless they have qualified on all



the equipment.

In addition, the Faculty of Education of The University of Calgary is carrying on an experimental approach to the undergraduate curriculum which involves a beginning course in communications. This course (Ed CI 202) is a full year course which contains four six weeks elements — speech, semantics, group interaction, and media. If this approach proves itself valid and becomes the basic course for all beginning students in education, they will become quite familiar with media as a means of education during the first year of their teacher preparation. (Correspondence, 1970)

This approach is similar to the program at the University of Alberta which does offer specific courses in the use of various technologies with the emphasis being placed on their value in communications.

Recommendation 242. That school boards be encouraged to build up their own basic audio-visual libraries.

Recommendation 243. That the Audio-Visual Aids Branch re-examine the nature of its services on the assumption that school boards will be responsible for the basic local audio-visual aids libraries.

Implementation of recommendations 242 and 243 is a continuous process. Both recommendations are considered to have been implemented in part. Board expenditures for audio visual aids are partially reimbursed through the School Foundations Grant. How much of a total grant is spent on audio visual aids depends on local decisions.

Some indirect encouragement for boards to build up their own basic audio visual aids libraries is provided by the Audio Visual Services Branch. For example, it is felt that the practice of circulating film strips and movies actually restricts their use by discouraging teachers and boards from buying their own. Thus, some consideration has been given to discontinuing filmstrip distribution and providing a "previewing service" for local areas. (James, interview, 1970) Further indications of this policy are evident in the estab-



lishment of the Alberta Educational Communications Authority to co-  
ordinate and administer educational television. (Edmonton Journal,  
March 17, 1970: 29) Schools will be encouraged to develop video-tape  
facilities rather than 16 mm film libraries. The Audio Visual Ser-  
vices Branch will provide dubbing services at a central location.  
Thus, local areas will be encouraged to build up a video-tape library  
of tapes that are reusable.

### Television

Recommendation 244. That study and development of educational television be maintained to determine the full possibilities of this medium as a teaching-learning aid in the public schools.

Recommendations 245. That the province make funds available for expansion of programs and experimentation in educational television at all school levels.

The nature of the intent of recommendations 244 and 245 is such that their implementation is of a continuous nature. Both recommendations are considered to have been implemented in part. The Alberta Pilot Projects for Television in Education have provided a solid base for ETV experimentation at all levels in Alberta. Government financial support was officially established, by Order-in-Council, December 28, 1966. A cost sharing plan was thus approved between the Department of Education in co-operation with the Calgary and Region Educational Television Association (CARET), the Metropolitan Edmonton Educational Television Association (MEETA), and various other school authorities. The Pilot Projects were initially intended to be completed in June, 1969 but have been extended to June, 1970. During the following two years the Projects will be completely evaluated and permanent policy recom-



mendations are planned for 1972.

Recommendation 246. That study be commenced regarding the design of facilities best suited to the educational use of television.

This recommendation has been implemented in part. This factor of design of facilities is not as crucial as was once thought. Improved commercial products have eliminated much concern. It is possible that the recommendation was actually made through a misunderstanding of the requirements of ETV at the time. People were concerned with such factors as the shape of the room and lighting which are not considered as crucial as people once thought. (Morton, interview, 1970)

Recommendation 247. That the Faculty of Education consider the requirements of initial training and inservice preparation of teachers for the use of this teaching aid.

Recommendation 247 has been implemented in part. As with recommendation 241, pertaining to instruction in the use of audio visual aids, the emphasis is on the media as an integral part of the total teaching-learning situation:

It is our belief that the instructional uses of television form an intrinsic part of all overall technical systems approach to education, and we have no plans to teach a separate course in this subject. All students who take the media courses receive extensive training in the use of television in the teaching-learning process, and most of our students have a "micro teaching" experience prior to doing their student teaching. In this way, I believe that we are meeting the requirements of future teachers for knowledge and experience in the use of television.

As far as inservice training of teachers in the use of television is concerned, CARET has carried on a variety of activities in the Calgary area to meet this need, and we have not felt the necessity of becoming involved in this at this time. (Bell, correspondence, 1970)

Recommendation 248. That the provincial government initiate action to reserve sufficient channels for telecasting educational programs.

Recommendation 249. That in the meantime arrangements be made



for the development and the broadcasting of educational programs by existing stations.

These recommendations have been implemented in full. The Department of Education has attempted for a number of years to acquire sufficient channels for the Pilot Projects. The Federal Government was very reluctant to grant channels in anything but the ultra-high frequency range (UHF). Until recently, most television sets were produced without UHF reception capabilities. In a Brief to the Board of Broadcast Governors (October 25, 1966) the Department of Education requested the use of a channel in the very high frequency (VHF) range which can easily be received by most television sets in the home. MEETA is presently broadcasting on Channel 11, Edmonton, in the VHF range.

Prior to this, some use was made of local CBC and CTV facilities.

#### Improvement of Textbooks

Recommendation 250. That with regard to basic texts, the Department of Education be provided with an annual budget to be used to upgrade the quality of these texts.

Recommendation 251. That the best available combination of educationists and non-educationist personnel be commissioned to give effect to Recommendation 250.

These recommendations have been implemented in part. Provisions definitely exist within the Department for the improvement of all instructional facilities--including textbooks. Educators and non-educators both have a voice in determining all aspects of the school curriculum, including the textbooks, through representation on the Elementary and Secondary School Curriculum Boards and the Lay Advisory Board on Curriculum and Instruction.



The concern for the improvement of textbooks at the provincial level is somewhat irrelevant today considering the considerable freedom at the classroom level for teachers to select appropriate textbooks. Any textbook, if approved by the local school board, may be used by teachers. (Hrabi, 1960: 5)

## DISCUSSION

Table 15 is a summary of the degree of implementation of the recommendations pertaining to facilities and equipment. Each recommendation is classified in terms of one of the levels of "Action" of the conceptual framework described in Chapter 1.

The analysis of the reactions and actions pertaining to the recommendations on facilities and equipment indicates a number of trends similar to those described in Chapter 4 for the recommendations concerning administrative personnel.

The only two recommendations classified as rejected are considered irrelevant in terms of the forces and conditions existing in Alberta today. A basic list of library books, as advocated in recommendation 228, is viewed as being restrictive due to the improved qualifications and resourcefulness of library personnel. Similarly, the concern for a central servicing center, recommended in number 237, is no longer relevant due to cataloging services provided by publishers and commercial agencies.

Implementation has been delayed or prevented for a number of recommendations due to lack of clarity of intent or lack of specificity of the implementing group or method. Recommendation 221, for example,



Table 15. The Degree of Implementation of Those Recommendations Pertaining to Facilities and Equipment

Implemented in Part	Implemented in Full	Still Under Consideration	Rejected
223	222	221	228
226	225	224	237
229	232	227	
230	235	233	
231	248	236	
234	249		
238			
239			
240			
241			
242			
243			
244			
245			
246			
247			
250			
251			



which advocates the recognition of essential non-instructional facilities for grant purposes, leaves considerable room for interpretation as to what is essential. Recommendation 224, pertaining to norms for the travel time of students, avoids the question of who should establish these norms and ignores the difficulty of establishing meaningful norms for areas characterized by considerable diversity of requirements and facilities.

An analysis of Tables 11 and 12 suggests the considerable influence exerted by the civil service on the degree of implementation of the recommendations pertaining to facilities and equipment. No major discrepancies exist between the reactions of the Special Committee and the official position of the Department of Education as stated in Sessional Paper #68/61. A similar finding for those recommendations pertaining to Administrative Personnel was discussed in Chapter 4 and the expression by a senior official of the Department of Education of the possible influence of civil servants on the implementation of various recommendations was noted. (Byrne, interview, 1970)

Analysis of the action taken illustrates the considerable importance attached to those recommendations pertaining to audio visual aids and television. Of the eleven recommendations made in these two areas, two have been implemented in full and nine have been partially implemented. No recommendations have been rejected and none are still under consideration. Of those recommendations which are classified as implemented in part, six, numbers 239, 240, 242, 243, 244, and 245, are so classified due to the continuous nature of their implementation and, consequently, the probability of these recommendations ever being fully implemented is remote.



Contrasted with this apparent importance attached to teaching aids is the seemingly lesser concern for library services. Of the eleven recommendations pertaining to this area, two have been implemented in full, five have been implemented in part, two are still under consideration, and two have become irrelevant and, consequently, rejected.

It is significant to note that implementation of a number of recommendations pertaining to libraries depends on the prior implementation of recommendation 235, which advised the provision of library supervision for schools by the Department of Education. The fact that this recommendation was not implemented in full until 1966 could possibly account for the present degree of implementation of several other recommendations pertaining to libraries.

#### SUMMARY

This chapter provided information on the questions posed under the levels "Reaction" and "Action" of the conceptual framework of the study described in Chapter 1 for those recommendations pertaining to Facilities and Equipment.

The "Reactions" of the various groups were taken from their official statements pertaining to the recommendation of the Cameron Commission.

For the purposes of this study, the "Actions" are interpreted as present degrees of implementation of the recommendations as defined in Chapter 1. Table 15 provides a summary of the degree of implementation of those recommendations pertaining to Facilities and Equipment. Pos-



sible explanations for the present degree of implementation of the recommendations are discussed and a number of significant trends suggested by the analysis of the "Reactions" and "Actions" is indicated.



## Chapter 6

### OTHER MATTERS OF ORGANIZATION

The recommendations dealt with in this study under other matters of organization pertain to two substantive areas--the responsibility of the A.T.A. with respect to staff load and the provision for educational opportunities and citizenship development for Hutterites and Native Indians. This chapter details the initial reactions of various groups to these recommendations and their present degree of implementation.

### THE REACTIONS

The initial reactions of four of the groups being considered can be summarized very briefly.

The A.S.T.A. did not consider any of the recommendations pertaining to other matters of organization to be the responsibility of school boards and, consequently, did not state an official reaction to any of them in 1960.

The Department of Education's Special Committee did not agree with recommendation 256, which advised that teachers not conduct professional improvement activities during school time, but did agree with recommendations 260, 265, and 266, which advocated an emphasis on the educational opportunities and citizenship of Hutterites and In-



dians. No other recommendations were reacted to.

The A.T.A. agreed in principle with recommendations 255, 256, both concerning staff load, and 260 to 267 inclusive, pertaining to the education of Hutterites and Indians.

The Faculty of Education did not react to any of the recommendations considered in this chapter.

The official reactions of the Department of Education are summarized in Table 16. It is significant to note that the reactions to a number of recommendations of the Special Committee differ considerably from the official reactions of the Department of Education. The Special Committee did not agree with recommendation 256, which advocated that teachers not conduct professional development activities during school time. The Department, on the other hand, agreed that the number of days devoted to such activities should be reduced. However, as is illustrated in the following section, the action taken by the Department agrees more with the reaction of the Special Committee than with its own initial reaction.

The Special Committee agreed with recommendations 265 and 266, which advocate an emphasis on the educational opportunities and citizenship of Native Indians. The Department, however, maintained the position that the education of Treaty Indians was a Federal responsibility. Changes in Departmental policy on this matter are detailed in the following section.



Table 16. Official Reaction of the Department of Education to Those Recommendations Pertaining to Other Matters of Organization: Sessional Paper #68/61, 1961

Number	Official Reaction of Department
255	The salaries and working conditions of teachers have improved rapidly in recent years, and members of the profession should now be willing to assume added responsibilities and obligations. The number of school days and hours presently devoted to teachers' conventions, institutes, staff meetings and the like, should be reduced. These activities are desirable but should not occupy as much school time as they presently do. The Alberta Teachers' Association should give very serious attention to these recommendations.
260	Schools in Hutterite Colonies follow the regular course of studies approved by the Department of Education for all schools in the Province
261	Since the education of the children of Treaty Indians
262	is presently the responsibility of the Government of
263	Canada, the initiative in bringing about the integration
265	suggested by these recommendations should be taken by
266	that Government rather than by the Government of Alberta.
267	



## THE ACTIONS

As in the two previous chapters, recommendations are grouped for the purpose of describing the degree of implementation by substantive areas.

Staff Load

Recommendation 255. That The Alberta Teachers' Association take the initiative in reassessing the obligations of teachers, vice-principals, principals and other members to give service beyond the normal period of ten months.

Recommendation 256. That The Alberta Teachers' Association re-examine the obligation of the profession to conduct self-improvement activities and essential meetings at such times as will not unduly reduce the length of the school year or shorten the school day.

Both of these recommendations have been rejected. Legal provisions existed for four regular school days to be used by local teachers' associations--two for conventions and two for approved in-service activities. (Orders-in-Council 805/62, 271/68 and 2373/68)

These provisions are ones that teachers in Alberta seem determined to preserve. Educational policies 3.A.11, 6.A.12, and 6.A.13 of the Alberta Teachers' Association state the following:

3.A.11 BE IT RESOLVED, that The Alberta Teachers' Association advocate that school boards make provisions for teachers to attend educational conferences which are of benefit to the educational system. (A.T.A. Members' Handbook, 1970: 185) (1969)

6.A.12 BE IT RESOLVED, that The Alberta Teachers' Association advocate that teachers not be required to teach more than six of eight full quarters nor be permitted to teach more than six consecutive quarters. (A.T.A. Members' Handbook, 1970: 191) (1969)



6.A.13 BE IT RESOLVED, that The Alberta Teachers' Association advocate that a normal school year be three full quarters with additional remuneration for additional teaching service in proportion to a normal year's salary. (A.T.A. Members' Handbook, 1970: 191) (1969)

Recent proposed changes in the School Act which would have placed the granting of these provisions regarding professional development within the powers of local school boards elicited sharp objection from some members of the Alberta teaching force. (Edmonton Journal, March 6, 1970: 44)

The main concern of the Alberta School Trustees' Association is that official A.T.A. business not be conducted during school time. (Wiedenhammer, interview, 1970) Policy statement number 117 of the A.S.T.A. (Handbook, 1970: 38) which originated as Executive Resolution number seven to the 1964 A.S.T.A. Convention, states: "The conduct of internal A.T.A. business should be undertaken by teachers outside of school hours."

### Hutterites

Recommendation 260. That the same basic educational standards and emphasis on citizenship be required in Hutterite schools as in all other Alberta schools.

It is difficult to determine any degree of implementation of this recommendation except that it is still under review. Considerable action has been taken but the extent to which the action contributed to the implementation of this recommendation depends on the interpretation of the concept "citizenship". If citizenship is interpreted within the Canadian or Albertan context there is considerable reason to classify the recommendation as rejected. If, however, citi-



zenship is interpreted in the Hutterite context there is little doubt as to the full implementation of this recommendation.

Public and government reaction to the Hutterites reached major proportions in 1947 with the ordering of a Committee of the Legislative Assembly of the Province of Alberta Appointed to Obtain Information Regarding Colonies or Societies of Hutterian Brethren. The information obtained was to be used to guide proposed changes in the Land Sales Prohibition Act which was extended to include a separate act, The Communal Property Act, passed in 1947. The Act:

. . . set forth the conditions under which Hutterites might acquire additional lands to augment existing colonies or establish new ones. Briefly, it purported to limit the amount of land that a colony might acquire by purchase, or by any other means and prevent the establishing of new colonies within forty miles of existing ones. (Hayes, 1959: 16)

The Brief of the Alberta School Trustees' Association to the Committee of the Legislative Assembly in 1947 mirrors much of the public sentiment towards the Hutterites. The Brief states that: the Hutterites refuse to assist the society in which they are living in any way (Brief: 3); the existence of the large tracts of Hutterite land are detrimental to neighbouring farmers and to Alberta agriculture as a whole (Brief: 4); the educational practices on the colonies are designed to preserve the Hutterite culture and resist outside influences of any kind (Brief: 8); the quality of teachers is poor and few teachers ". . . willingly undertake their duty in a Hutterite school." (Brief: 8)

On the influence of the educational practices the Brief concludes:

So long as this system prevails, however, there seems to be no possibility of assimilating the Hutterite Brethren into the normal life of the Community, or making them responsible Canadian citi-



zens. Four hundred years of their history demonstrates this. (1947: 8)

A study of Hutterites in Canada by Hostelter and Redekop (1962) concluded that one of the variables which will best predict the survival of any group, especially a sectarian religious group, is its ability to control the educational process. On the basis of their evidence, the authors predict that the Hutterite identity will be preserved indefinitely if there are no major changes in the factors at work.

The Brief of the Camrose Chamber of Commerce (1958) to the Cameron Commission echoed many old sentiments:

Whereas, Hutterite Colonies contribute nothing to the advancement of Agriculture in Alberta,

And whereas, Hutterite Colonies do not support our democratic form of government and are passive islands in the communities in which they have been settled, producing nothing active in government or culture or social life, to further that community, and so further the Province of Alberta, . . .

And whereas, they resist incorporation into the national culture by rural isolation to preserve a way of life antagonistic to Canadian Nationalism,

And whereas, these large blocks of land in the rural areas are increasing and each constitutes an inanimate island which contributes little or nothing to the community, and which creates hardship socially and economically to the farmers whose land borders their holdings,

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED:

1. That further expansion of Hutterite Colonies be discouraged in Alberta as they are detrimental to Alberta's economic and social progress, and in opposition to Canada's development as a united and strong nation.

2. That schools on Hutterite Colonies be closed and that the children from these colonies be educated in consolidated schools so that they may be encouraged to higher education and wider social contacts.

The minutes of the nineteenth regular meeting of the members of the Cameron Commission (January 27, 28, 29, and 30, 1959) indicated,



under Item 210, that it was decided to leave the matter of Hutterite schools to a later date since the problem was being investigated by a special committee appointed by the Commission and authorized by Order-in-Council 1298/58. The findings of the special committee (Hayes, 1959) were not made available in time to be included in the Commission Report.

The special committee found that ". . . progress towards assimilation is slow because the Hutterites, due to their strong group cohesion will it to be slow." (Hayes, 1959: 14-15) One of the duties of the committee was ". . . to determine whether or not the existing educational facilities established for Hutterite colonies are satisfactory, especially in the matter of instruction in the responsibilities of Canadian Citizenship." Regarding this matter, the committee concluded:

This question directed to an ethnic group other than the Hutterites might be considered as quite innocuous; but the fundamental differences underlying their way of life in comparison with those of other ethnic groups propounds a problem fraught with difficulties not easy of solution.

If measures can be devised that will neither compromise the religious values of the Hutterites nor the educational requirements of the Province, then the problem will be resolved. (Hayes, 1959: 25)

The problem is apparently far from resolved. An investigation by Rees, then Assistant Chief Superintendent of Schools, revealed little change in the educational practices on the Hutterite Colonies. "There is little stimulation or approbation from the home, church or community to reinforce the school in its endeavour to promote education." (Rees, 1965: 7)

The problem was again evidenced in a recent refusal of a County Council to provide a special school for a district Hutterite colony.



The County Council offered to set up a special classroom for the Hutterite children in an existing divisional school but the Hutterites preferred to arrange for a private school providing the County would provide two teachers. (Edmonton Journal, April 15, 1970: 10)

### Indians

Recommendation 261. That the Alberta government pursue agreement with the Dominion government to the end that more provincial responsibility may be assumed for the education of Indian children.

Recommendation 262. That thorough study be made as to whether integration in schools is the best policy; and, if so, how Indian children can best be prepared for this policy.

Recommendation 263. That where integration is considered best, special education be given non-Indian children that they may appreciate and understand the heritage and problems of the Indian children during a period of adjustment.

Recommendation 262 has been implemented in full. In 1964 the Minister of Citizenship and Immigration asked that a study be undertaken, in co-operation with the provincial Departments of Education, of the contemporary situation of the Indians of Canada. The report, "A Survey of the Contemporary Indians of Canada," edited by Dr. H. Hawthorne, of the University of British Columbia, is an exhaustive analysis of the economic, political and educational needs and policies relating to Canada's native peoples. (Hawthorne, 1966, Part 1 and Hawthorne, 1967, Part 2)

Regarding the advisability of integration in schools, the Hawthorne Report concludes:

The principle of integrated education for all Canadian children is recommended without basic question. The integration of Indian children into the public school system should proceed with due concern for all involved and after the full cooperation of local Indians and non-Indians has been secured. (1967: 12)



The preparation of Indian children for this policy is based on the conclusion that it is crucial for the child to have some opportunity to succeed in his first year in school. Towards this end, the Indian child should be provided with a nursery school and kindergarten program on the reserve. In general, the program would provide the Indian child with an opportunity to learn the things he must know by school entry and to participate in many experiences that are often taken for granted--experiences with a variety of play media, books, records, and short trips in the locality. (Hawthorne, 1967: 148)

Recommendation 263, advocating the preparation of non-Indians for integration, has been implemented in part. The University of Alberta has introduced a Program in Intercultural Education. The Program description appears in the calendar of the Faculty of Education of the University of Alberta as follows:

The Department of Elementary Education offers a special program in Intercultural Education, designed to prepare teachers for work in schools in areas where other cultures (e.g., Indian or Eskimo) prevail. This program entails the selection of options in accordance with a prescribed pattern, and the acquisition, in addition to academic training, of relevant practical experience. (1969-70: section 73.2.5)

There is no evidence that this recommendation has been implemented to any significant degree at any other level.

Recommendation 261, regarding the assumption of more responsibility on the part of the provincial government for the education of Indians, has been implemented in part:

As regards education, it is the opinion of the responsible authorities in the Alberta government that the Indians must have the same opportunities as the other citizens of the Province. For this reason, the Department of Education has set up the Northland School Division. There is no racial discrimination in this school district and school integration is a fact. Encouragement is also being given to greater participation by the Indians in educational matters, and



112

it has become possible for Indians to be elected school trustees, even if they do not pay any real estate taxes.

The school program which the Indians follow is that of the Province, except for some recent adjustments permitting the study of the Indian languages and of local history by young Indians. The purpose of these courses is to broaden the knowledge of Indian students of their own cultural traditions and to increase their pride in their origins, as well as their knowledge of their environment. (Hawthorne, 1967: 43-44)

Recent reaction to the MacDonald-Chretien white paper has retarded the integration process in Alberta. That part of the white paper advocating the repeal of the Indian Act is viewed with suspicion by many of Canada's native peoples and has been the target of severe criticism by their leaders. Harold Cardinal, whom Jon Ruddy referred to in a recent issue of Maclean's magazine as ". . . the unquestioned leader of Alberta's treaty Indians and the Great Red Hope of Canada's native peoples" (Ruddy, 1969: 20), has indicated that there is a more basic issue at stake than the inadequacy of the Indian Act. The real problem is the outstanding issue between the federal government and the Indian people--the question of Indian rights. (Cardinal, 1969: 140)

The Indian peoples' reaction was that the government did not consult with them to a sufficient degree regarding the procedures suggested in the MacDonald-Chretien paper. Success of the integration program depends entirely on the complete involvement of the Indian people. (Dew, interview, 1970)

The stated aim of the Indian Affairs Branch is the extension of basic provincial services to Indians and has been accepted in principle by the provinces. The following table, Table 17, indicates the degree to which Indian students in Alberta are integrated into provincial schools. The data indicates that in 1957, 544 of a total 4,887 Treaty Indians were being educated in provincial schools (about 11%), while



Table 17. Indian Student Enrolment 1937-69: Comparative Table  
(Indian Education: Alberta, 1969-70: 1)

Year	Indian Day Schools	Indian Residential Schools	Provincial Schools	Total
1937	35	1951	Not available	1986
1949	154	2113	Not available	2267
1957	1783	2560	544	4887
1958	2074	2079	596	4749
1959	2253	1992	644	4889
1960	2609	1742	756	5107
1961	2829	1641	1031	5501
1962	3093	1367	1316	5776
1963	3181	1254	2252	6686
1964	2945	1035	2958	6938
1965	3137	911	3445	7493
1966	3771	Included in Day	4145	7916
1967	3620	School Enrolment	4421	8041
1968	3527		5044	8571
1969	3651		5345	8996



in 1969, 5,345 of a total 8,996 Treaty Indians were in provincial schools (about 59%).

Concern that the rapidity of the integration program may be detrimental to the adjustment of the Indian child has recently been expressed by both Dr. H. Hawthorn (Edmonton Journal, February 4, 1970: 1) and Indian leaders. (Edmonton Journal, May 7, 1970: 33) In a brief to the Worth Commission presented recently at St. Paul, the Saddle Lake band condemned the integration of Indian children into white schools. (Edmonton Journal, April 30, 1970: 3)

Concern for the speed of integration is hardly an invention of the last few years. The transcript of the hearing given the Indian Association of Alberta during the presentation of its brief to the Cameron Commission (May 27, 1958) contains the following dialogue between Commissioner, G. L. Mowat and Association representative, J. Laurie:

Mowat: One of your points is that everyone should go slow with this integration policy.

Laurie: Yes, there should be a great deal of research and study.

There has been research and there has been study. But to what degree has there been integration? The answer to this, of course, depends on the definition of integration. Perhaps the simplest definition, and one that contains the ultimate objective of the integration process, is inherent in the following statement by Gooderham: "By the end of this century one would expect there will be need for neither special penalties nor special privileges for Indian children. Unless this state is achieved, integration will remain unrealized." (Waller, 1965: 101)

Recommendation 264. That the courses of studies, particularly



social studies, be scrutinized to see that a fair and proper treatment is given to the place of the Indian people in the history of Canada.

Implementation of this recommendation is a continuous process and, consequently, recommendation 264 is considered to have been implemented in part. A committee comprised almost exclusively of native peoples was set up in 1968 by the Department of Education whose object it was to examine all materials recommended by the Department, particularly in the area of Social Studies and Science. In addition to suggesting the removal of those materials judged prejudicial, the committee also suggested the inclusion of some material that contained a positive approach to the history of the native peoples. (Hrabi, interview, 1970)

Just how satisfactory the effects have been is a matter of personal interpretation. Recent attacks on school textbooks are still critical of the tendency to depict the Indian ". . . always in a losing situation. . . ." (Edmonton Journal, April 30, 1970: 30) The expression of dissatisfaction with textbooks is not confined to the elders. At a recent Native Youth Society seminar one speaker stated that, "The history given in schools of our heritage gives us nothing to be proud of; rather it makes us ashamed to be native." (Edmonton Journal, May 11, 1970: 29)

Recommendation 265. That the whole education program envisioned in this report be extended to Indian children.

This recommendation is still under consideration. Its implementation clearly awaits the conclusion of the complete transfer of educational responsibility to the provincial government.

Recommendation 266. That adult education programs designed to assist the Indian people to a greater degree of citizenship be undertaken.



This recommendation has been implemented in part.

In the field of adult education upgrading classes have been provided at Edmonton, Regina and Prince Albert. These courses are offered to Indians from eighteen to twenty-five years of age who, having left school, require special training to prepare them for industry and life away from their reserves. The course consists of an eight-month program of academic, social and occupation orientation, with permanent employment as the final goal. (Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, 1967: 21)

This federal program is still in its initial stages. The plan is being co-ordinated with provincial efforts in anticipation of total provincial assumption of responsibility in this area. (Dew, interview, 1970)

Recommendation 267. That Indian children be not denied the right to an education because of lack of finances of their parents.

This recommendation has been implemented in full. Total financial support is available for any academically capable student that applies. (Dew, interview, 1970)

#### DISCUSSION

Table 18 is a summary of the degree of implementation of the recommendations pertaining to other matters of organization. Each recommendation is classified in terms of one of the levels of "Action" of the conceptual framework described in Chapter 1.

Unlike the rejected recommendations in the two previous chapters, the two recommendations pertaining to staff load, numbers 255 and 256, which are classified as rejected in this chapter, have not been rejected due to irrelevancy. The provisions for professional development activities and work load referred to in these recommendations are ones that teachers seem determined to preserve. Implementation of these recom-



Table 18. The Degree of Implementation of Those Recommendations Pertaining to Other Matters of Organization

Implemented in Part	Implemented in Full	Still Under Consideration	Rejected
261	262	260	255
263	267	265	256
264			
266			



mendations would require a reversal of A.T.A. policy and, considering that these policies were accepted in 1969, the possibility that such a move is contemplated by the A.T.A. in the near future appears remote.

The evidence suggests that recommendation 260, advocating an increased emphasis on citizenship standards for Hutterites, appears to have little chance of being implemented in full. The recommendation is not specific as to its intent, the group at which it is directed, or the method of implementation. What, for example, is meant by "a basic emphasis on citizenship?" Is the recommendation directed at the Department of Education, the A.T.A., or the elders of the Hutterite Colonies? Who has the power to implement this recommendation? The prior discussion on this recommendation, included under a consideration of the action taken, indicated that the above questions must be clearly answered before the recommendation can be properly interpreted. The recommendation, as it is worded, provides little possibility of being implemented.

The implementation of recommendation 265, that the education program envisioned in the Cameron Report be extended to Indian children, is dependent on the prior implementation of recommendations 261, 262, and 263, which advocate provincial responsibility for the education of Indians and an examination of the advisability of an integration policy. Although recommendation 262, advising that a study be made of the integration policy, is classified as having been implemented in full, several questions raised by the recommendation remain unanswered--to what extent will integration, into society or into the schools, continue to be the best policy and what, exactly, is meant and implied by the concept of integration?



Much of the problem in defining and initiating integration originates from the necessity of total involvement on the part of the Indian people. They must decide on the degree of integration they desire and they must provide the impetus to initiate the process. (Hawthorne, 1966: 10) One fact which may prevent any recommendations pertaining to the integration of Indians, including those of the Cameron Commission, from ever being implemented is that some Indians simply do not desire that integration take place. (Hawthorne, 1966: 11)

Recommendation 263 advocates that non-Indian children be helped to ". . . appreciate and understand the heritage and problems of the Indian children. . . ." The difficulty of satisfactorily implementing this recommendation is indicated in the findings of the Hawthorne study:

The public concern about the Indians and the public knowledge of their problems that would demand a change are scanty and uneven. Public knowledge does not even match public misconception. Not enough is known of the problems to create a call for their solution. (Hawthorne, 1966: 6)

#### SUMMARY

This chapter provided information on the questions posed under the levels "Reaction" and "Action" of the conceptual framework of the study described in Chapter 1 for those recommendations pertaining to Other Matters of Organization.

The "Reactions" of the various groups were taken from their official statements pertaining to the recommendation of the Cameron Commission.

For the purposes of this study, the "Actions" are interpreted as present degrees of implementation of the recommendations as defined in



Chapter 1. Table 18 provides a summary of the degree of implementation of those recommendations pertaining to Other Matters of Organization. Possible explanations for the present degree of implementation of the recommendations are discussed and a number of significant trends suggested by the analysis of the "Reactions" and "Actions" is indicated.



## Chapter 7

### CONCLUSIONS, IMPLICATIONS AND DISCUSSION, AND SUGGESTIONS FOR FURTHER STUDY

#### SUMMARY OF THE PROBLEM

The Royal Commission on Education in Alberta represented a considerable investment of time and human and financial resources. This study was designed to provide information on the forces and conditions existing in Alberta in the era preceding the ordering of the Commission. Information was also sought on the concerns and issues in relation to the substantive areas of administrative-organizational features as indicated by the recommendations made in these areas and by their sources and origins. Finally, for those recommendations pertaining to administration and organization, the reactions of various groups were determined and the final degree of implementation of each recommendation was ascertained.

The conceptual framework of the study, illustrated schematically in Chapter 1, contains four main levels through which it was considered that a recommendation could be shown to develop from its origin to its present degree of implementation; Forces, Origins and Sources, Reactions, and Actions. Corresponding to each of these levels of the conceptual framework is a general question on which this study was designed



to provide information:

1. What forces or conditions were influential in the ordering of the Royal Commission on Education in 1957?
2. What were the origins and sources of the final recommendations of the Commission Report dealing with organization and administration?
3. What was the degree of acceptance of the recommendations?
4. To what extent have the recommendations been implemented and what factors might explain the varying degrees of implementation?

Information was also sought on a number of more specific questions which are subcategories of the above four general questions. These specific questions are discussed in Chapter 1.

## CONCLUSIONS

It is important to stress that the conclusions derived from this study are based on the investigation of the forces and conditions pertaining to procedures associated with the recommendations of a particular commission relevant within a certain time span. Any attempt to generalize beyond these restrictions on the basis of the following conclusions must acknowledge the limitations of such a procedure.

The following conclusions are discussed under the headings of the conceptual framework of the study. For this purpose, the four levels of the framework are combined; "Forces" and "Origins and Sources" are considered together as are "Reactions" and "Actions." It is most meaningful to consider the conclusions in this manner since it was found



that, in many cases, the origins and sources of recommendations were associated with particular forces and, similarly, certain reactions were seen to precipitate various actions.

### Forces, Origins, and Sources

Although no single force can be identified as having clearly "caused" the ordering of the Cameron Commission, the forces described in Chapter 2 could be considered to have combined to form a more global concept of the climate of the times. The Commission, therefore, could be viewed as a response to, as well as being a part of, this climate--the educational, social, economic, and political aspects of Alberta in the 1950's.

Although no one force could be singled out as primarily responsible for the ordering of the Cameron Commission, a number of forces did appear to exert more influence than others--especially with respect to originating concern in certain substantive areas dealt with in the recommendations of the Report.

One such force was the impact of a rapidly changing and expanding economic base and the concomitant rapid urbanization. The changes clearly illustrated that, for educational purposes, there could no longer be a rural-urban distinction. It was realized that equality of educational opportunity must reach across geographical boundaries if the provincial educational system was to prepare the children of the province for a meaningful place in a rapidly changing society.

A number of recommendations of the Cameron Report pertaining to administration and organization were considered to have originated from



concerns precipitated by this aspect of Alberta's society in the 1950's. In addition to a renewed concern for the quality of rural education, the question arose as to which administrative and organizational procedures would best facilitate the integration of the school system with the growing demands made of it by a changing society. Recommendations advocating increased guidance services, further local control in education, and improvement of pupil conveyance and residential facilities reflect the renewed concern for the quality of rural education and the emphasis on administrative and organizational procedures best suited to a changing society.

The analysis of the sources of the recommendations pertaining to organization and administration suggested a considerable influence exerted by educators on the procedures and conclusions of the Commission. It was possible that the lay members of the Commission

. . . were generally more impressed with the views of educators than with those of lay groups or of the prominent critics. In the last analysis, educators not only were aware of problems in public education but were capable of suggesting solutions. (Mowat, interview, 1970)

Two other interrelated conclusions revolve around the influences on the Commission and the public reaction to its functioning. First, the relative ineffectiveness of the press to sway the Commission's conclusions--particularly with respect to the progressivist-traditionalist controversy--was apparent. Second, Black's study (1960) indicated the possibility that the public, in general, was unaware of the Commission and its purposes and demonstrated a significant lack of interest in their schools--therefore, the criticism of educational practices and of educators was apparently due to an extremely vocal minority.



The three conclusions present an unusual situation. Why should a press, hostile towards education in general, whose demands were largely ignored by the Commission, cease in its hostility shortly after release of the Commission Report--especially with the impact of educators so obvious on the Commissions findings? The implications and suggestions for further study arising out of the interaction of these three conclusions are discussed in following sections.

As was indicated in Chapter 2, there were definite political overtones in the ordering of the Commission. The reaction of what apparently was a vocal minority, including the press, against the largely imagined crippling effects of the progressivist movement in Alberta was particularly influential in eliciting governmental action. The ordering of the Commission reassured people that a responsible group was concerned about the quality of education and was making every effort to correct the educational system. It served to instill a great deal of confidence in the people of Alberta. (Mowat, interview, 1970), (Rees, interview, 1970)

The Commission provided an opportunity for dissatisfactions to be aired and fears to be expressed--it was a "catharsis." (Byrne, interview, 1970) Although causality would be difficult to demonstrate, it was pointed out that, shortly after the findings of the Commission were released, criticism of education in Alberta began to decrease. (Mowat, interview, 1970) The Commission, viewed from this perspective, was a definite response to political forces.

One question that remains unanswered and, perhaps, unanswerable is, "What impact did the Commission have on the educational system of Alberta?" A measure comprised, in part, of the percentage of the rec-



ommendations implemented and the degree of implementation could be devised. Similarly, a measure based on a comparison of practices before and after the Commission could also be included. It appears, however, that no measure, regardless of its composition, would satisfactorily serve to determine the impact of the Commission. There are too many variables that can only be analyzed on a subjective basis.

As previously mentioned, a causal relationship is very difficult, if not impossible to establish. For example, to what extent did the Commission simply predict what was going to happen as opposed to influencing its occurrence? To what extent would certain changes have occurred regardless of the activity of the Commission in that area? To what extent was the change inevitable due to the forces and conditions existing in society? If an organization stated, in its brief to the Commission, that certain changes were necessary or would have been beneficial and this recommendation was included in the final report, can any of the ensuing changes be attributed to the impact of the Commission? Certainly many of the recommendations were part of the professional thinking of the time and one of the purposes the Commission served was to lend validity to ideas. (Byrne, interview, 1970) Such was the case with the concept of educational television. (Morton, interview, 1970)

A similar feeling was expressed by Chalmers:

. . . while many of the Commissioners' recommendations are not in harmony with the educational thinking of the people of Alberta, yet it is safe to assume that for many years to come, the Report will be carefully thumbed by educators, trustees, clergymen, and others whenever any significant new development appears imminent in Alberta's educational picture. Some will search its pages to find insights and guidelines for the uncertain future; others will be equally diligent to find arguments to sustain their pre-conceived positions for or against any change. "The devil can cite Scripture for his purpose." (Chalmers, 1967: 170-171)



Reactions and Actions

A number of conclusions can be drawn regarding the conditions under which recommendations were likely to be implemented. Similarly, certain factors can be identified which prevented or delayed implementation of certain recommendations.

Recommendations were likely to be implemented in cases wherein initial reaction was favourable or in cases wherein some degree of implementation had been achieved prior to the presentation of the Commission's findings. For example, the official reaction of the Department of Education to recommendations 244 and 245 (see Table 12) indicate prior steps taken towards the implementation of the practices intended by these recommendations. Considerable human and financial resources have since been invested in the study of educational television as advocated by these recommendations. The classification of recommendations 244 and 245 as implemented in part does not indicate a lack of effort in this area but, rather, is indicative of the continuous nature of the implementation of these recommendations.

Recommendations were likely to be held under continued consideration or implementation delayed if initial reaction was unfavourable. Typical of such recommendations is number 175 advocating a transfer to locally appointed superintendents for divisions and counties. The initial Departmental reaction was one of disapproval of such a move and, consequently, the practices intended by the recommendation did not come into force until 1968.

Those recommendations which have not been implemented have been rejected for one of several reasons. First, the intent of the recom-



mendation is contrary to the existing policy of one of the implementing groups. Second, local conditions have prevented implementation. Third, the intent of the recommendation is irrelevant in terms of present conditions. Fourth, the recommendation was implemented at one time but subsequent action has reversed this implementation and, within the framework of this study, the recommendation is classified as rejected. The recommendations which fall into each of these four categories are listed in the following text.

Implementation of recommendations 255 and 256, which relate to the provisions for professional development activities and work load, would require a reversal of A.T.A. policy.

Recommendations 176, 184, and 185 advocate the establishment of job specifications for superintendents and principals and job qualifications for principals. Varying local conditions have prevented any real need for implementation of these recommendations from arising.

Recommendations 195 and 196, which deal with the certification of guidance personnel, and of recommendations 228 and 237 which advocate the need for a basic list of library books and a central library servicing center, are irrelevant in terms of present conditions and the recommendations are, therefore, rejected. The ideas contained within these recommendations were not unsound; they were just replaced by better ones.

Recommendation 192, advocating the sponsorship of a plan to increase the supply of guidance personnel, was implemented and then reversed.

A number of recommendations were not fully implemented simply because they were not directed at any particular group or the recom-



129

mendation was not specific as to its intent. For example, the recommendation, "That the same basic educational standards and emphasis on citizenship be required in Hutterite schools as in all other Alberta schools," presents several problems that virtually guarantees its non-implementation. Who, for example, should be charged with the responsibility of ensuring that Hutterite schools emphasize citizenship to the same extent as all other Alberta schools? To what extent do other schools emphasize citizenship? In what ways? Can citizenship be given a definition that is applicable to all Alberta schools and, if so, can a common means of emphasizing this citizenship be detected? Can, as Hayes (1959: 25) asks, a means be found that will make compatible the religious values of Hutterites and the educational requirements of Alberta? If the only group who can assume responsibility for the implementation of this recommendation is the Hutterite society, then the citizenship that is stressed will be their own interpretation of citizenship--as is the case in all societies.

Recommendations involving the clash of values or policies between groups within whose domain the recommendation lies were also destined to non-implementation. Those recommendations advocating extended service from teachers and the conducting of professional development so as not to shorten the school year were hardly new topics of discussion between the A.T.A. and the A.S.T.A. However, as was indicated by Weindenhammer, progress during discussions between organizations is often prevented by some "policy, regulation or belief." (Interview, 1970)

One conclusion that is of considerable significance is that involving the impact of the civil service on the degree of implemen-



tation of the recommendations. A recommendation which met with approval in a Government Department was more likely to be implemented than one which was not accepted by the professional educators in the Department. (Byrne, interview, 1970) This conclusion is not surprising considering the global perspective of the Department. The responsibility for many of the recommendations is at the local level and, since local situations vary, the implementation of a recommendation in one area may not be as relevant as its implementation in another. (Mowat, 1960) As the official Department reaction in 1961 to recommendations dealing with local superintendents suggests (Table 7), these recommendations were not immediately implemented because it was a Department decision not to implement them.

#### IMPLICATIONS AND DISCUSSION

Of the numerous forces which appeared to have contributed to the ordering of the Cameron Commission, one was possibly unique in that it was the only force over which the Commission could have exercised a significant measure of control--the considerable criticism of education on the part of a vocal minority.

The conclusion that much of the criticism of education is derived from a vocal minority has several implications. These vocal minorities should be clearly identified and their ideas carefully evaluated so that the sources of their criticism may be investigated in an attempt to determine its justification. This conclusion also implies a necessity for a concentrated effort to involve others in the educational debates--not just to seek support for the present educational



system but to ascertain the true feelings and attitudes of society.

The conclusion that educators had a very significant impact on the findings of the Commission implies a serious dilemma when viewed from the perspective expressed by a Commissioner (Hansen, 1964) that Royal Commissions on Education should include practicing educators among its members. Would a commission composed entirely, or almost entirely, of educators be unduly influenced by the views of educators? Would the conclusions of such a commission be truly representative of the total spectrum of society or would its perspective be too narrow? Further, what would be the ramifications of educators examining their practices in public?

The conclusions regarding reasons for the non-implementation of recommendations have implications for future commissions. Implicit in these findings is the need to specify the implementing group or groups along with a recommendation. Of even greater importance is the directing of recommendations only to those groups which have the authority to implement them. "How" the recommendation is to be implemented and "by when" are two other factors which might be included in recommendations--especially if the commission is future-orientated and the implementation is designed to be an integrated part of some larger plan. Such a practice might also reduce the possibility of recommendations becoming irrelevant in the near future.

The conclusion that implementation of a recommendation may be hindered due to lack of clarity of intent clearly implies that care should be taken in defining terms used in recommendations. What, for example, does "integration" mean when applied to Canada's native peoples? If a recommendation advocates that integration take place,



what would be accepted criteria that it had in fact occurred?

The possibility that conflicting values prevents the implementation of recommendations implies that the implementation of recommendations should not necessitate the co-operation of groups whose values or policies must be seriously compromised.

#### SUGGESTIONS FOR FURTHER STUDY

The preceding conclusions and implications suggest further areas where information would be desirable. Several possible research questions arising out of the findings of this study are enumerated below:

1. What was the impact of the press, or the mass media, on commissions pertaining to education as compared to its impact on the procedures and conclusions of commissions in other areas of public concern?
2. To what extent do educational opportunities for urban and rural children differ at present?
3. Much of the public concern over the educational practices in Alberta were seen to have arisen out of misconceptions about what progressivism implied and a lack of knowledge of the aims and objectives of the schools. Further, there was a suggestion (Black, 1960) that the average citizen was not inordinately interested in the public educational system. These findings indicate an urgent need to determine the extent to which communication exists between the school and society at present.



Further research questions, arising from the conceptual framework, can be posed for the consideration of the procedures and conclusions of Royal Commissions on Education since the ordering of the Cameron Commission in 1957:

1. What is the relative impact of educators and the press on the procedures and conclusions of the Royal Commission on Education?
2. What is the total impact of the mass media on the Royal Commission? What is the degree of public awareness of the Commission and its objectives?
3. To what extent is the present era characterized by rapid or sweeping changes in society? To what extent have these changes led to an investigation of educational practices?
4. It may prove valuable to test the usefulness of the conceptual framework and method of this study in an effort to trace the development and implementation of recommendations contained in the reports of other commissions.



## BIBLIOGRAPHY

Advisory Committee Meeting on Television. Minutes of First Meeting. May 20, 1959.

Alberta, Bill 35: An Act Respecting Schools. The Legislative Assembly of Alberta, Third Session, 16th Legislature, 19 Elizabeth II. (1970).

Alberta Pilot Projects for Television in Education. Progress Report. February, 1970.

Alberta School Trustees' Association. Brief Submitted to the Legislative Assembly of the Province of Alberta. February, 1947.

\_\_\_\_\_, School Bus Survey No. 3. March 22, 1965.

\_\_\_\_\_, Handbook. 1970

Alberta Teachers' Association. Members' Handbook. 1969

Aldridge, A. A. "Full Steam Ahead," Guidance Newsletter, Guidance Branch, Department of Education, Alberta, (summer, 1968).

Black, D. B., et al. "Public Attitudes Towards Education," Journal of Experimental Education, XXIX (September, 1960), 23-35.

Blair, W. "Provincial Video Tape Dubbing Centre," Signpost, (January, 1970), 14.

Breton, R. and J. C. McDonald. Career Decisions of Canadian Youth. Department of Manpower and Immigration, 1967.

Byrne, T. C. Composite High Schools in Canada: Alberta. Monographs in Education, No. 1, Edmonton, The Alberta Advisory Committee on Educational Research, University of Alberta, 1959.

Calgary Power, Ltd. Alberta: Province of Opportunity. Calgary: Calgary Power Ltd., 1958.

Cameron, D. et al. Report of the Royal Commission on Education in Alberta. Edmonton: Queen's Printer, 1959.

Cameron, D. A. "Education--Key to Survival," The A.T.A. Magazine, XL (March, 1960), 6-10<sup>+</sup>.

Campbell, W. G. Form and Style in Thesis Writing. 3rd ed. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1969.



Canadian School Libraries Association. A Study of Library Services for Canadian Schools. 1967.

Cardinal, H. The Unjust Society. Edmonton: M. G. Hurtig, Ltd., 1969.

Chalmers, J. W. "Pupil Conveyance in Alberta," Alberta School Trustee, XXVIII (May, 1958), 17-19.

\_\_\_\_\_, Schools of the Foothills Province. Toronto: Published for The Alberta Teachers' Association by University of Toronto Press, 1967.

Clarke, S. C. T. "The Cameron Report: A Condensation of the Report of the Royal Commission on Education in Alberta," The A.T.A. Magazine, XL (March, 1960).

\_\_\_\_\_, "The Cameron Commission--Ten Years After," Address to ARA Banquet, April 16, 1968. (mimeo)

Comment and Criticism. "A Commission Reports," The Alberta School Trustee, December, 1959, 2-5.

\_\_\_\_\_, "Television in Education," The Alberta School Trustee, June, 1960, 3-7.

Department of Economic Affairs, Alberta. Alberta's Economic Prospects: Brief to the Gordon Royal Commission. December, 1955.

Department of Education, Alberta. Annual Report.

\_\_\_\_\_, Brief to Board of Broadcast Governors. October 25, 1966.

\_\_\_\_\_, Regulations Pursuant to the School Buildings Act: Alberta Regulation No. 199/68. January 1, 1968.

\_\_\_\_\_, Brief to the Standing Committee on Broadcasting, Films and Assistance to the Arts. January, 1968.

\_\_\_\_\_, News Release No. 25: The School Foundation Program. February 16, 1970.

Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, Indian Affairs Branch. Indians of the Prairie Provinces. March, 1967.

\_\_\_\_\_, Local Government Survey--Alberta Region. 1969.

\_\_\_\_\_, The Canadian Indian. March, 1966.

\_\_\_\_\_, Indian Affairs: Facts and Figures. September, 1967.

Department of Industry and Development, Alberta. Alberta: Industry and Resources. (Alberta Bureau of Statistics, 1959).



Dominion Bureau of Statistics. The Organization and Administration of Public Schools in Alberta. 1966.

\_\_\_\_\_, Survey of Libraries. Part II. Academic Libraries. 1969.

Dunlop, G. M., R. J. C. Harper and S. Hunka, "The Influence Of the Time Spent in School Buses Upon the Achievement and Attendance of Pupils in Alberta Consolidated Schools," Alberta Journal of Educational Research, III (December, 1957), 170-179.

Gillis, H. W. "School Libraries," The A.T.A. Magazine, XL (November, 1959), 22.

Government of the Province of Alberta. General Regulations Under the Department of Education. (1968).

Gue, L. R. "A Comparative Study of Value Orientations In an Alberta Indian Community," Unpublished Doctor's dissertation, University of Alberta, Edmonton, 1967.

Hansen, W. "The View From 1964," The CSA Bulletin, IV (October, 1964), 21-40.

Hawthorn, H. B. (ed.). A Survey of the Contemporary Indians of Canada, Part 1. Ottawa: Indian Affairs Branch, 1966.

\_\_\_\_\_, A Survey of the Contemporary Indians of Canada, Part 2. Ottawa: Indian Affairs Branch, 1967.

Hayes, C. P. Report of The Hutterite Investigation Committee. Edmonton, September, 1959.

Heshidahl et al., "How Well Do We Teach Indian Children?" The B.C. Teacher, XLIX (January, 1970), 148-153+.

Hostelter, J. A., and C. Redekop, "Education and Assimilation in Three Ethnic Groups," Alberta Journal of Educational Research, IV (December, 1962), 189-203.

Hrabi, J. S. Curriculum Building Procedures in Alberta. (Curriculum Branch, Department of Education, Alberta. July, 1969).

Indian Affairs Branch, Alberta Region. Indian Education: Alberta, 1969-70. 1970.

James, I. R. "What It Can Mean," Signpost, (January, 1970), 15.

\_\_\_\_\_, "16 MM Pegasus or Nightmare," Signpost, (January, 1970), 20-22.

James, I. Media '70: A Consultive Report. Department of Education, Alberta (Audio-Visual Services Branch, 1970).



Jones, M. "Safety on School Buses," Alberta School Trustee, XXVIII (April, 1958), 7-11.

Katz, S. "How Safe Is Your Child in a School Bus?" The A.T.A. Magazine, XXXIX (February, 1959), 15-20.

Lambert, R. S. "The Challenge of Television in Education," The Alberta School Trustee, XXVIII (April, 1958), 5-7.

Lawrence, P. Report of the Committee on Alberta School Bus Operations, April 1, 1961.

Library Associations of Alberta, Saskatchewan, and Manitoba. Brief to the Presidents of the Four Western Provincial Universities: School of Library Science for the Prairie Provinces. 1964.

Library Services Branch, Department of Education, Alberta. School Library Survey. 1966.

Lyseng, M. and Watt, E. Television Evaluations: 1968-1969. Department of Education, Alberta (Audio-Visual Services Branch, 1970).

, Radio Evaluations: 1968-1969. Department of Education, Alberta (Audio-Visual Services Branch, 1970).

MacDonald, J. "Changing Philosophies of Education," The A.T.A. Magazine, XL (March, 1960), 13-18+.

Morton, R. "Educational Television in Canada," The Alberta School Trustee, XXIX (January, 1959), 9.

Mowat, G. L. "Whose Responsibility Now?" The Alberta School Trustee, XXX (September, 1960), 10-15.

Pilot Project at Faculty of Education, Edmonton, March 17 to March 28, 1958. Evaluation of Closed-Circuit Educational Television. Summary of Armstrong Experiment.

Ponting, R. C. "Rural Vocational High Schools: A Brief Presented on Behalf of the Westlock School Division, Annual Meeting of Zone 2," The Alberta School Trustee, XXX (March, 1960), 7-9.

Rees, R. Hutterite Education. (Department of Education, 1965).

Ruddy, J. "What the Canadian Indian Wants From You," Maclean's, LXXXII (December, 1969), 19-22.

School Broadcasts Branch, Department of Education, Alberta. Educational Television--Its Place in Alberta. November, 1958.

, Windows to Learning: Report of a Joint Educational Television Experiment. March, 1959.



School Libraries Consultant, Department of Education, Alberta. Book Selection Aids for Elementary School. 1969-70.

\_\_\_\_\_, Book Selection Aids for Junior and Senior High Schools. 1969-70.

Shorter, L. T. "The Alberta Pilot Projects," The A.T.A. Magazine, (February, 1969), 33-36.

Stephens, C. "Schools and Public Libraries," The A.T.A. Magazine, XXXVII (October, 1956), 7-8.

The Alberta Teachers' Association. The Cameron Commission--Two Years After. Series on Problems in Education, No. 4. Edmonton: November, 1961.

Uhlman, H. J. Rural Alberta: Patterns of Change. Monographs in Education, No. 5, Edmonton, The Alberta Advisory Committee on Educational Research, University of Alberta, 1961.

Waller, L. G. P. The Education of Indian Children In Canada. The Canadian Superintendent, 1965. Toronto: The Ryerson Press, 1965.

Worth, W. H. "An Analysis of the Editorial Treatment of Education in the Alberta Press," Alberta Journal of Educational Research, I (September, 1955), 54-62.

\_\_\_\_\_, "The Principal's Leadership Role," The A.T.A. Magazine, XXXVII (November, 1956), 25-27.



## APPENDIX A

## PERSONAL INTERVIEWS CONDUCTED

I. James	Coordinator of Visual Education, Audio-Visual Services Branch, Department of Education	February 4, 1970
R. Morton	Associate Director of Cur- riculum (Educational Media), Department of Education	February 4, 1970
T. C. Byrne	Deputy Minister of Education	February 19, 1970
F. N. Dew	Regional Superintendent of Schools, Indian Affairs	February 23, 1970
R. E. Rees	Associate Deputy Minister of Education and Chief Sup- erintendent of Schools	February 24, 1970
L. Ferguson	Supervisor of Guidance, Department of Education	February 26, 1970
B. A. Friderichsen	School Libraries Consultant, Department of Education	March 4, 1970
J. S. Hrabi	Director of Curriculum, Department of Education	March 5, 1970
S. R. Reed	Head of School of Library Science, University of Alberta	March 9, 1970
T. Wiedenhammer	Provincial Secretary, Alberta School Trustees' Association	March 11, 1970
M. J. Powell	Coordinator, Alberta Teachers' Association, Guidance Council	March 13, 1970
L. G. Hall	Director of School Administration	March 23, 1970
G. L. Mowat	Chairman, Department of Edu- cational Administration, Faculty of Education, University of Alberta	April 29, 1970



## APPENDIX B

## PERSONS PROVIDING RELEVANT INFORMATION BY CORRESPONDENCE

A. Herman	Associate Professor of Educational Psychology, Faculty of Education University of Calgary	April 1, 1970
A. F. Brown	Professor and Academic Services Officer, Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, Toronto	April 2, 1970 and April 17, 1970
R. C. Conklin	Department of Educational Psychology, Faculty of Education, University of Calgary	April 9, 1970
K. M. Snow	Assistant Professor, Curriculum Instruction, Materials Center, University of Calgary	April 14, 1970
H. Hengel	Student Counselling Services, University of Calgary	April 16, 1970
W. R. Morris	Historian for the Alberta Teachers' Association Guidance Council, Medicine Hat	April 28, 1970
R. H. Bell	Professor in Education and Director, Instructional Media Services, Faculty of Education, University of Calgary	May 7, 1970



MASTER CARD: BROWN COMPILATION

SUBJECT CATEGORIES		TYPE OF SOURCE		HORIZONTAL CATEGORIES		TERMS OF REFERENCE AND FINE CLASSIFICATIONS	
BRIEF NUMBER	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
1	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
2	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
3	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
4	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
5	5	6	7	8	9	10	11
6	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
7	7	8	9	10	11	12	13
8	8	9	10	11	12	13	14
9	9	10	11	12	13	14	15
10	10	11	12	13	14	15	16
11	11	12	13	14	15	16	17
12	12	13	14	15	16	17	18
13	13	14	15	16	17	18	19
14	14	15	16	17	18	19	20
15	15	16	17	18	19	20	21
16	16	17	18	19	20	21	22
17	17	18	19	20	21	22	23
18	18	19	20	21	22	23	24
19	19	20	21	22	23	24	25
20	20	21	22	23	24	25	26
21	21	22	23	24	25	26	27
22	22	23	24	25	26	27	28
23	23	24	25	26	27	28	29
24	24	25	26	27	28	29	30
25	25	26	27	28	29	30	31
26	26	27	28	29	30	31	32
27	27	28	29	30	31	32	33
28	28	29	30	31	32	33	34
29	29	30	31	32	33	34	35
30	30	31	32	33	34	35	36
31	31	32	33	34	35	36	37
32	32	33	34	35	36	37	38
33	33	34	35	36	37	38	39
34	34	35	36	37	38	39	40
35	35	36	37	38	39	40	41
36	36	37	38	39	40	41	42
37	37	38	39	40	41	42	43
38	38	39	40	41	42	43	44
39	39	40	41	42	43	44	45
40	40	41	42	43	44	45	46
41	41	42	43	44	45	46	47
42	42	43	44	45	46	47	48
43	43	44	45	46	47	48	49
44	44	45	46	47	48	49	50
45	45	46	47	48	49	50	51
46	46	47	48	49	50	51	52
47	47	48	49	50	51	52	53
48	48	49	50	51	52	53	54
49	49	50	51	52	53	54	55
50	50	51	52	53	54	55	56
51	51	52	53	54	55	56	57
52	52	53	54	55	56	57	58
53	53	54	55	56	57	58	59
54	54	55	56	57	58	59	60
55	55	56	57	58	59	60	61
56	56	57	58	59	60	61	62
57	57	58	59	60	61	62	63
58	58	59	60	61	62	63	64
59	59	60	61	62	63	64	65
60	60	61	62	63	64	65	66
61	61	62	63	64	65	66	67
62	62	63	64	65	66	67	68
63	63	64	65	66	67	68	69
64	64	65	66	67	68	69	70
65	65	66	67	68	69	70	71
66	66	67	68	69	70	71	72
67	67	68	69	70	71	72	73
68	68	69	70	71	72	73	74
69	69	70	71	72	73	74	75
70	70	71	72	73	74	75	76
71	71	72	73	74	75	76	77
72	72	73	74	75	76	77	78
73	73	74	75	76	77	78	79
74	74	75	76	77	78	79	80
75	75	76	77	78	79	80	81
76	76	77	78	79	80	81	82
77	77	78	79	80	81	82	83
78	78	79	80	81	82	83	84
79	79	80	81	82	83	84	85
80	80	81	82	83	84	85	86
81	81	82	83	84	85	86	87
82	82	83	84	85	86	87	88
83	83	84	85	86	87	88	89
84	84	85	86	87	88	89	90
85	85	86	87	88	89	90	91
86	86	87	88	89	90	91	92
87	87	88	89	90	91	92	93
88	88	89	90	91	92	93	94
89	89	90	91	92	93	94	95
90	90	91	92	93	94	95	96
91	91	92	93	94	95	96	97
92	92	93	94	95	96	97	98
93	93	94	95	96	97	98	99
94	94	95	96	97	98	99	100
95	95	96	97	98	99	100	101
96	96	97	98	99	100	101	102
97	97	98	99	100	101	102	103
98	98	99	100	101	102	103	104
99	99	100	101	102	103	104	105
100	100	101	102	103	104	105	106
101	101	102	103	104	105	106	107
102	102	103	104	105	106	107	108
103	103	104	105	106	107	108	109
104	104	105	106	107	108	109	110
105	105	106	107	108	109	110	111
106	106	107	108	109	110	111	112
107	107	108	109	110	111	112	113
108	108	109	110	111	112	113	114
109	109	110	111	112	113	114	115
110	110	111	112	113	114	115	116
111	111	112	113	114	115	116	117
112	112	113	114	115	116	117	118
113	113	114	115	116	117	118	119
114	114	115	116	117	118	119	120
115	115	116	117	118	119	120	121
116	116	117	118	119	120	121	122
117	117	118	119	120	121	122	123
118	118	119	120	121	122	123	124
119	119	120	121	122	123	124	125
120	120	121	122	123	124	125	126
121	121	122	123	124	125	126	127
122	122	123	124	125	126	127	128
123	123	124	125	126	127	128	129
124	124	125	126	127	128	129	130
125	125	126	127	128	129	130	131
126	126	127	128	129	130	131	132
127	127	128	129	130	131	132	133
128	128	129	130	131	132	133	134
129	129	130	131	132	133	134	135
130	130	131	132	133	134	135	136
131	131	132	133	134	135	136	137
132	132	133	134	135	136	137	138
133	133	134	135	136	137	138	139
134	134	135	136	137	138	139	140
135	135	136	137	138	139	140	141
136	136	137	138	139	140	141	142
137	137	138	139	140	141	142	143
138	138	139	140	141	142	143	144
139	139	140	141	142	143	144	145
140	140	141	142	143	144	145	146
141	141	142	143	144	145	146	147
142	142	143	144	145	146	147	148
143	143	144	145	146	147	148	149
144	144	145	146	147	148	149	150
145	145	146	147	148	149	150	151
146	146	147	148	149	150	151	152
147	147	148	149	150	151	152	153
148	148	149	150	151	152	153	154
149	149	150	151	152	153	154	155
150	150	151	152	153	154	155	156
151	151	152	153	154	155	156	157
152	152	153	154	155	156	157	158
153	153	154	155	156	157	158	159
154	154	155	156	157	158	159	160
155	155	156	157	158	159	160	161
156	156	157	158	159	160	161	162
157	157	158	159	160	161	162	163
158	158	159	160	161	162	163	164
159	159	160	161	162	163	164	165
160	160	161	162	163	164	165	166
161	161	162	163	164	165	166	167
162	162	163	164	165	166	167	168
163	163	164	165	166	167	168	169
164	164	165	166	167	168	169	170
165	165	166	167	168	169	170	171
166	166	167	168	169	170	171	172
167	167	168	169	170	171	172	173
168	168	169	170	171	172	173	174
169	169	170	171	172	173	174	175
170	170	171	172	173	174	175	176
171	171	172	173	174	175	176	177
172	172	173	174	175	176	177	178
173	173	174	175	176	177	178	179
174	174	175	176	177	178	179	180
175	175	176	177	178	179	180	181
176	176	177	178	179	180	181	182
177	177	178	179	180	181	182	183
178	178	179	180	181	182	183	184
179	179	180	181	182	183	184	185
180	180	181	182	183	184	185	186
181	181	182	183	184	185	186	187
182	182	183	184	185	186	187	188
183	183	184	185	186	187	188	189
184	184	185	186	187	188	189	190
185	185	186	187	188	189	190	191
186	186	187	188	189	190	191	192
187	187	188	189	190	191	192</td	



## APPENDIX D

## NUMERICAL LIST OF BRIEFS REFERRED TO IN THIS STUDY

No.	Submitted by:
1.	Architects' Association of Alberta
4.	Alberta Drama Board
5.	Alberta Federation of Agriculture
6.	Alberta Federation of Home and School Associations
7.	Alberta Library Association
8.	Alberta Library Board
11.	Alberta Teachers' Association
12.	Alberta School Trustees' Association
13.	Association of Professional Engineers
20.	Canadian Association for Health, etc. (Women's Branch)
24.	Canadian Mental Health Association
25.	Catholic Conference of Alberta
28.	Department of Agriculture (Alberta)
32.	Edmonton Educational Study Group
34.	Edmonton Public School Local, A.T.A.
35.	Edmonton Separate School Board
36.	Edmonton Separate School Teachers
66.	University of Alberta Faculty of Education
71.	Willis, Dr. C. B.
73.	Alberta Federation of Labour
80.	Calgary City Local, A.T.A.
82.	Calgary School Board
89.	High School Administrators
92.	Indian Association of Alberta
102.	Athabasca Home and School Association
105.	Camrose Chamber of Commerce
107.	Fairview A.T.A. Local
114.	High Prairie Home and School Association
140.	Provost Home and School Association
154.	Alberta Women's Institutes
155.	County of Wetaskiwin
156.	Five-School Project
163.	Brown, Mr. E. W.
169.	Spencer, J. A. (Librarian at Magrath) re: Libraries



## APPENDIX E

## RECOMMENDATIONS REFERRED TO

## Chapter 4: ADMINISTRATIVE PERSONNEL

## Superintendents

175. That legal provision be made whereby divisions and counties may appoint their own superintendent in lieu of a provincially-employed superintendent.
176. That the province specify in law such functions of the locally-appointed superintendent as will safeguard immediate provincial interests in education.
177. That qualifications with force of law be established to govern eligibility for appointments of all superintendents in Alberta.
178. That direct and indirect benefits now common to the superintendents' and teachers' groups in Alberta be suitably preserved (pension, tenure, etc.)
179. That an avowed transition plan be devised to effect the transfer from provincially-appointed superintendents to locally-employed superintendents in divisions and counties.

## Special Services

180. That the province enter the service field of supervision through the provision of highly qualified and specialized regional consultants.
181. That the development of a regional system of special services be coordinated with the plan of transfer away from provincially-appointed generalists, and include, as required, more training or retraining of present field personnel.
182. That the immediate nucleus of each regional office include high school inspectors, specialist personnel in reading, English language, guidance; and superintendents required to inspect rural and small urban schools which are independent of divisions and counties.
183. That the Department of Education pay grants to local authorities who employ superintendents, according to a true equalization principle, or failing this, in amounts which would be equal to the salary paid the superintendent if he were provincially-employed.



## Principals

184. That desirable qualifications be established with regard to the principalship in Alberta.
185. That job specifications as indicated in this report be included in The School Act to clarify and give status to the full scope of the principal's duties.
186. That the Department of Education, with other parties concerned, intensify efforts to gauge the needs for professional assistant personnel in local school systems.
187. That as a service to local systems, the Department of Education sponsor continued study of the optimum assistant and special staff required to operate effectively schools of varying sizes.

## Guidance

188. That a thorough study of the extent, nature, and quality of the present guidance services in the province be made.
189. That since specialized skills are required to perform the guidance function adequately, these services be withheld until suitable personnel are available.
190. That at all levels, persons assigned to counselling services be rigidly selected as to personality, preparation and interest.
191. That as soon as qualified personnel are available, all school systems, rural and urban, initiate or extend guidance and counselling services to meet their needs.
192. That a plan be sponsored immediately by the Department of Education, trustees, teachers and the University, whereby the supply of qualified guidance personnel may be increased to meet present needs.
193. That guidance and counselling personnel be selected from qualified teachers with appropriate experience.
194. That financial assistance be available for selected teachers wishing to enrol in special courses for the purpose of engaging in various phases of guidance and counselling work.
195. That the requirements for a Junior Certificate in Guidance be reviewed and revised.
196. That courses towards both the Junior and Senior certificate be as a special program and at the graduate level only.



## Chapter 5: FACILITIES AND EQUIPMENT

## Facilities and Equipment

221. That some means be devised whereby essential non-instructional facilities be recognized for purposes of grants.
222. That the province establish a School Buildings Advisory Committee, to include architects, engineers and other suitable specialists, for the purpose of planning an evaluation of school buildings.
223. That the terminal objective of such a plan be to publish information to guide school boards.

## School Buses

224. That norms be established for the travel time of students on school buses, and that school boards be urged to heed these norms through more careful consideration of equipment needed to perform service within designated time limits.

## Residences

225. That the Department afford special study to the place of pupil residences in the public school system.
226. That grants and services re school buildings be extended to include school residences.
227. That a plan be developed and held in readiness whereby the Department will sponsor the training of selected personnel to operate school residences.

## Libraries

228. That a basic list of library books be devised to include all types desirable in a school.
229. That minimal and compulsory book quotas be established for schools of various enrolments.
230. That the system of school grants be modified to provide incentive for the establishment and development of school libraries and the



employment of professional librarians.

231. That criteria be established to indicate need for librarians in schools or in school systems.
232. That both library renewal and maintenance grants be provided by the province.
233. That all teachers receive instruction in techniques of using the library in their teacher education program.
234. That the government investigate the advisability of asking the University to introduce library science courses for the training of teacher-librarians.
235. That the Department of Education provide specialist library supervision and advice for the public schools.
236. That coordination of all library services within the province be effected under the Department of Education.
237. That a study be made of the values to be derived from a provincial library servicing centre.
238. That the possibilities of making the school library accessible and of service to the general community be explored.

#### Audi-Visual Aids

239. That the Department of Education sponsor the development of a pool of persons competent in audi-visual aids to assist in the in-service education of teachers.
240. That emphasis upon audio-visual aids in the in-service education of teachers be increased.
241. That as part of the pre-service or undergraduate education of teachers, the Faculty of Education study the merits of offering an intense short course designed as an introduction to the proper use of audio-visual aids.
242. That school boards be encouraged to build up their own basic audio-visual aids libraries.
243. That the Audio-Visual Aids Branch re-examine the nature of its services on the assumption that school boards will be responsible for the basic local audio-visual aids libraries.

#### Television

244. That study and development of educational television be maintained to determine the full possibilities of this medium as a teaching-learning aid in the public schools.
245. That the province make funds available for expansion of programs and experimentation in educational television at all school levels.
246. That study be commenced regarding the design of facilities best suited to the educational use of television.
247. That the Faculty of Education consider the requirements of initial training and inservice preparation of teachers for the use of this



teaching aid.

248. That the provincial government initiate action to reserve sufficient channels for telecasting educational programs.

249. That in the meantime arrangements be made for the development and the broadcasting of educational programs by existing stations.

## CHAPTER 6: OTHER MATTERS OF ORGANIZATION

### Improvement of Textbooks

250. That with regard to basic texts, the Department of Education be provided with an annual budget to be used to upgrade the quality of these texts.

251. That the best available combination of educationists and non-educationist personnel be commissioned to give effect to Recommendation 250.

### Staff Load

255. That The Alberta Teachers' Association take the initiative in reassessing the obligations of teachers, vice-principals, principals and other members to give service beyond the normal period of ten months.

256. That The Alberta Teachers' Association re-examine the obligation of the profession to conduct self-improvement activities and essential meetings at such times as will not unduly reduce the length of the school year or shorten the school day.

### Hutterites

260. That the same basic educational standards and emphasis on citizenship be required in Hutterite schools as in all other Alberta schools.

### Indians.

261. That the Alberta government pursue agreement with the Dominion government to the end that more provincial responsibility may be assumed for the education of Indian children.



262. That thorough study be made as to whether integration in schools is the best policy; and, if so, how Indian children can best be prepared for this policy.
263. That where integration is considered best, special education be given non-Indian children that they may appreciate and understand the heritage and problems of the Indian children during a period of adjustment.
264. That the courses of studies, particularly social studies, be scrutinized to see that a fair and proper treatment is given to the place of the Indian people in the history of Canada.
265. That the whole education program envisioned in this report be extended to Indian children.
266. That adult education programs designed to assist the Indian people to a greater degree of citizenship be undertaken.
267. That Indian children be not denied the right to an education because of lack of finances of their parents.



## APPENDIX F

## REGULATIONS RE LOCALLY APPOINTED SUPERINTENDENTS -

Pursuant to subsection (1) of section 200 of The School Act, being Chapter 297 of the Revised Statutes of Alberta, 1955, as amended, which reads as follows:

"(1) Subject to such regulations as the Minister may from time to time establish the board of a district employing more than forty teachers may appoint a superintendent of schools,"

the following regulations are hereby established:

1. The decision of a board to establish an office of superintendent for its district is subject to the approval of the Minister.
2. At this time, with the exception of a city district that employs more than 100 teachers, the employing board shall secure the approval of the Minister for a candidate to the superintendency before the appointment is made.
3. A county or division proposing to employ a locally appointed superintendent of schools shall have secured the permission of the Minister of Education to do so no later than March 31st.
4. The following shall be the minimum qualifications of any person appointed to be a superintendent:
  - (a) He shall possess an Alberta teaching certificate.
  - (b) He shall have completed five years of teaching experience in the classrooms of Alberta or other comparable school system.
  - (c) He shall have achieved a university degree from the University of Alberta or from another University of equivalent standing.
  - (d) He shall have pursued graduate study of at least a year's duration, preferably in the field of administration, with the University of Alberta or with another university of comparable standing.

or

In lieu of graduate study he shall have served for a minimum period of ten years as a senior administrative officer



150

(principal, assistant superintendent, etc.) in the district  
(city or town) that appoints him.

August 15th, 1968









B29951